Contents

Mariusz Kraśniewski, *Pictures in Transition: Media and Popular Culture in Hausa Society* .......................................................... 5


Mahnaz Zahirinejad, *Women’s Rights in the Absence of New Middle Class Support in Iran* .......................................................... 61

Malwina Bakalarska, *Some Remarks on the Transport Services in Selected Cities in Nigeria and Benin* .................................................. 71


Agata Wójcik, *Made in Turkey: Middle Class, Economic Liberalization and Political Change* .................................................. 95
Pictures in Transition: Media and Popular Culture in Hausa Society

Abstract

Regarding society, popular culture is both a harbinger of change and the mirror that reflects social needs and interests. It is both harbored in local context, and prone to changes inspired by foreign influences. Hausa popular culture is not an exception, and the presented paper analyses leading trends in Hausa popular culture and their social reception. Cultural products, traditional and modern alike, could not be spread without some ways of transmission, so the analysis of the process of development of the media market in Northern Nigeria was also required to portray the links between media and popular culture.

Introduction

It is quite easy to define popular culture as the one that is widely accepted by the audience and is usually ‘soft’ and not complicated. Looking from a Hausa perspective, this simplified definition is becoming a little bit tricky. We thus have comedy movies, criminal drama and love songs with catchy tunes, but at the same time, in the Hausa mainstream market we can find music, that in the Western Hemisphere is usually associated with the underground scene and its high-cultural feeling. Finally we can find traditional, or using European terminology classical musicians, such as the recently deceased Dan Maraya Jos, who are equally respected by the elders and youth alike. Thus in the ‘melting pot’ called “Hausa popular culture”, we can find both tradition and modern influences from the globalized world. One can argue that Hausa culture is still in the process of transition (whilst traditional elements are still important for society), and has not yet been put into the niche known as tradition or folklore. Just take a short look at European folk music. Traditional songs, so highly acclaimed by ethnographers and sophisticated audiences alike, are usually just old, joyful, everyday songs from rural areas, that have been swept away from popular consciousness by global musical influences.

However, looking from a slightly different perspective, the bonds of Hausa people with folk culture can appear stronger than in the case of their European
counterparts, and then Hausa folk culture is less prone to be replaced by modern popular culture. It could be considered as a result of the relatively late appearance of the modern media.\(^1\) The development of modern media, i.e. the press, radio and television, was linked with the colonial conquest of Northern Nigeria and the same can be said about various forms of European style entertainment like literature, drama and cinema. It actually means that since the time when Hausa society was exposed to the wide stream of foreign influences, there have been many possibilities to preserve traditional forms of art and performance. Moreover, Europeans at this time appeared to be more interested in recording local, African culture than in the preservation of their own cultural heritage.

Popular culture in Europe has changed greatly through the ages and very early on divided itself into two separate repertories. One stream was a classical culture, that included ‘complicated’ music and books, that only the educated were able to read and comprehend. The other one consists of ‘good old’ folk tales — bawdy and jolly, accompanied by traditional instruments and dances. In the Hausa society, the line between folklore and classical culture was not so significant, and it depended more on social and religious factors than on the trendsetting abilities of the educated elites. First of all, in traditional Hausa society, the social status of musicians was generally low although their music was respected and desired. This could be linked to the role of the Maroka, who were wandering beggar minstrels and performers of praise songs. Whilst being patronized by the wealthy elites, they willingly accepted their status as serfs, and the nature of their occupation especially in the context of their irregular income, frequently reduced them to the position of mere street musicians, not so far from beggars.\(^2\) If it is possible, it has deteriorated even more after Usman Dan Fodio’s jihad. Although Sheikh Usman, was aware of the role of oramedia\(^3\) in the transmission of information and important messages, he openly despised music and dancing by branding them as non-Islamic and decadent.\(^4\) He had similar opinions about folktales, calling them “pointless gossip”, but unlike the

---

1. Here used as a contradiction to the traditional media based on orality and human memory.
case of music and dance, they were not banned and were simply withdrawn from the public sphere.

At the time of the European arrival, there was no local alternative for traditional music, as Dan Fodio’s supporters had not proposed any. As far as the arts were concerned they were only active in the field of literature, and the Sheikh himself, the author of many poems in Hausa, Fulfulde and Arabic, is considered as one of the first Hausa poets.\(^5\)

As one of the Hausa proverbs says: *Kome zurfin ruwa, da yashi a ciki* [However the water is deep, there is sand in it], and thus traditional music was the “sand” of the reformed society. Old traditions die hard, and wandering musicians simply transferred their services far from the sight of the most radical leaders. The result of the abovementioned factors was that the process of division of popular culture into two separate branches, folk and elite, simply did not happen, or happened on a very limited scale. Music was never considered important in Hausa society and the Holy War from the beginning of the 19th century, rendered it even more insignificant.

Before European colonization or media were the predominant, and for a long time, only source of information and entertainment in Sub-Saharan Africa. They include folktales and other forms of folk wisdom (such as proverbs and riddles), customs and traditions, and also music and ceremonies. They became endangered only when the ‘white Man’ came and brought new forms of amusement and modern media have arrived bringing great changes into Hausa society. It will be justified here to analyze the possible influences of media and the message that they pass on to local culture, but before that, we should start from a theoretical framework and thus describe the history of media in Northern Nigeria.

There are few media theories that are applicable here, but one should always remember, that the theories shaped in Europe usually reflect European society and are not always applicable to the African reality. Firstly, it is impossible to talk about media influences on society without reference to the ‘Agenda Setting’ theory. According to this idea, formulated in the first half of the 20th century, media shape concepts of social reality. They point at things, that should be considered important, and society follows their message just because it was in the media. The comprehension of this process is quite easy for anyone who has ever witnessed an overwhelming national interest in some insignificant but yet sensitively ‘touching’ news, when much more important issues were only briefly covered by media. This theory explains the process of media manipulation and can help to trace the efforts taken by the media companies to create social or political realities. Supplementary to the Agenda Setting, we could consider the

\(^5\) Piłaszewicz, *Historia literatur*...
Cultivation Theory, which points to the leading role of Television and treats this medium as the most important. These theories are reasonable and useful, but they are not universal. In Hausa society it is impossible to just take any type of information or cultural product via a TV Station, air it few times and create a new trend out of nowhere. It just does not work that way. If social concepts of reality are to be reshaped, the existing concepts of reality have to be initially taken into consideration. This takes us to another theory which apparently is in opposition to the ones just presented. This is the one that tells us that the media depend on social context, and as far as Hausa society is concerned, it is entirely true.

Here, religion is the most important factor. Early Islamization almost completely wiped out local traditional beliefs, and although some small minority of the population still practise old customs and perform bori rituals, Hausa society is now almost purely Islamic and the Muslim religion is the most important factor for self-recognition. Because of this, culture that should be regarded as “traditional” is actually the one that has emerged after Fulani jihad of the 19th century. That is why Hausa speakers are more likely to consider their heritage as Hausa-Fulani. So the opposition between the traditional and modern, is actually an opposition between Hausa-Fulani culture and Westernized culture and values. It is slightly different for example in the Yoruba society where religious identity is divided between Islam, Christianity and traditional, polytheistic beliefs. That is why when Fela Anikulapo Kuti, a Nigerian musician of Yoruba origin and founder of the ‘Afrobeat’ genre, wanted to distinguish himself from foreign influences, he despised Christianity and Islam alike. In the Yoruba society, the ladder from tradition to modernity has a few more rungs, and it’s hard to imagine any Hausa musician, who would refer to bori beliefs in order define himself. Although Hausa society is rather open and tolerant,

---

6 Ewa Siwierska, ‘Wyzwania dla dialogu międzyreligijnego w Nigerii’ [Challenges of the interreligious dialogue in Nigeria], Afryka, No. 36, 2012, p. 56.

7 It was clearly expressed in one of his songs, see the pidgin English lyrics below:

"One Christian and the other one Muslim
Anywhere the Muslims them they reign
Na Senior Alhaji na him be Director
Anywhere the Christians them they reign
Na the best friend to Bishop na him be Director
It is a known fact that for many thousand years
We Africans we had our own traditions
These moneymaking organizations
Them come put we Africans in total confusion"

Fela & Africa 70, Coffin for Head of State, Kalakuta Records, 1981.
it would not accept apostasy, and clear affirmation of “paganism” can lead to unpredictable consequences.

That is why theory about media dependency is so important here, as media broadcasters have to take into consideration those strong cultural and religious factors and literally depend on social context, whilst filtering information and the way it is presented in the media. It is true also for the Hausa society that the media, especially the audiovisual forms, are the harbingers of change and deliverers of new social norms and aesthetic values. However, while they incorporate global trends and cultural patterns, they have to be careful. Not only the international popularity of the particular product is important, but also its possibility of adjustment into local cultural criteria.

Ways of transmission. History of media in Northern Nigeria

The history of the media in Africa did not start with the arrival of European ships and soldiers. It started long before that and for many centuries the informative and entertainment functions were reserved to oral tradition. Islamization brought some significant changes not only in the way of living, but also in the perception of culture and education. In the 14th century Hausa ruler Yaji Dan Tsamiya, climbed Dala hill, that towers above the city of Kano and cut down holy tree of the pagan god Tsumburbura. He ordered the construction of a mosque at the place of the pagan shrine, and his people gave him the nickname (kirari), “Yaji, the entrapper of rocks”. During his rule not only mosques, but also many quranic schools were opened, and later on the development of Islamic education was stimulated by the travelling scholars from the Maghreb. In 1655 Dan Marina, the first known poet of Hausa origin, died. His works, as well as the works of his apprentice and successor Dan Masani, consist of praise songs for local rulers and educational pamphlets aimed at society in order to strengthen its Islamic values. They were many after them and probably there were also poets before them, but their works were either lost or destroyed. Education and literature was constantly in development in this part of Africa. Most works were written in Arabic but some of them were done in ajami script, the Arabic alphabet adjusted to the specifics of the Hausa language. The efforts of Sheikh Usman Dan Fodio and his supporters were mentioned before, and his works, mostly in the field of politics and education but also in the field of literature, changed Hausa society for many years to come. Their poems and pamphlets

---

8 Labaran Hausawa da Makwabtansu [Tales about Hausas and their neighbours], Vol. 2, Zaria: Translation Bureau, 1930, p. 28.
took the form of “media” in Hausaland as they spread both in written and in oral form, while the main channel was through face to face communication.

The arrival of the Europeans signified a meeting with an already well-developed system of education, a rich tradition of literature and a widely known system of writing in the non-standardized ajami script. The Europeans did not try to overwrite the existing structures, they simply created another choice for local society and the results of this choice were the benefits of Western Education. Mandatory conditions were set for public service and careers in colonial administration. Western education created new, Westernized products of culture and those products were spread through new channels, institutionalized media companies and publishing houses.

**Press**

The origins of the press in Northern Nigeria date back to 1932 when the British colonial administration launched the first news periodical called *Northern Provinces News/Jaridar Nigeria Ta Arewa/Jaridat al Nijeriya al Shimaliya*. It was published quarterly and consisted of 22 pages written in English, Hausa and Arabic. For the equivalent of half a penny, the reader received the opportunity to acquaint himself with new administrative resolutions and reports about the government’s activity.\(^9\) Regarding the type of information that was passed it would probably be hard to call the abovementioned journal a real newspaper. This goal was achieved seven years later in 1939, when the colonial administration launched *Gaskiya Ta Fi Kwabo*\(^10\) [The truth is more precious than a kobo]. Following the statement of Ibrahim Yaro Yahaya,\(^11\) this timing was not accidental and it was a response to the growing Nazi propaganda in the region, when local media were supposed to stand against radio broadcast and printed publications that could infiltrate from outside the borders of the British colony. As a form of reinforcement the influential *Gaskiya*\(^12\) a four page flyer in *ajami* script was introduced in 1941. These pages, known in Hausa as ‘*Yar Gaskiya Ta Fi Kwabo* [Sons of the Truth, that is more precious than

---


\(^10\) We can repeat after Balarabe Maikaba, that the arrival of *Gaskiya* marked the beginning of journalism and mass media in the North. Balarabe Maikaba, ‘Globalization Northern Media and the Changing Landscape in Nigeria’, in *Communication, Media and Popular Culture...,* p. 93.


\(^12\) The newspaper was later published under this shortened title.
a kobo] or in English *Ajami News Sheets*, were inaugurated in order to reach the people who were not able to read Latin script but had received Quranic education. Another argument to support Yahaya’s thesis was the launching of another newspaper — *Suda* (Herald). This title, distributed freely along with *Gaskiya*, was inaugurated in 1941, for purely propaganda purposes. Around 15,000 copies were distributed and its main topics oscillated exclusively around the theatre of World War II, with much emphasis placed on the successes of the Allied forces.

The first editor of *Gaskiya* was Alhaji Abubakar Imam, who shared his duties with L. C. Giles. Abubakar Imam, was already well known in the emerging literature market in Northern Nigeria. His book *Ruwan Bagaja* (The healing water) was among the first of the “European style” novels published by the British under the auspices of *Hukumar Talifi* (the Literature Bureau) in 1933. Later he published *Magana Jari Ce* [Speech is a Treasure], one of the masterpieces of Hausa literature. His participation in the creation of the first Hausa newspaper can serve as an example of the close connection between printed media and the literature market.

In addition, *Gaskiya* gave its name to the colonial publishing house subsequently known as the Gaskiya Corporation, which took over most of the functions of *Hukumar Talifi* and after 1945 was publishing both books and newspapers in Northern Nigeria. These functions were later adopted by the North Regional Literature Agency (NORLA) which was established in 1954, and which in turn was later replaced by the Northern Nigerian Publishing Company (NNPC).

Back in the 1950s all of the big cities in the North had their own newspaper, with those in Kano, Katsina, Zaria or Sokoto published in Hausa, but there were also some titles in other languages, like Maiduguri’s *AlBishir* which was published in Kanuri. Even more titles emerged after independence, among them some independent newspapers, financed from private sources and thus theoretically free from the interference from Federal or State administration.

---

14 Ibidem.
15 Ibid., pp. 96, 97.
16 Previously known as *Hukumar Fassara* (Translation Bureau), established in Kano in 1929, it later moved to Nasarawa and finally settled in Zaria. Among the goals of the Bureau were the translations of the books from Arabic and English into Hausa, the publication of Hausa novels and handbooks and helping those who wanted to publish their own books. It is hard to overestimate the role of the Bureau in the creation of the literature market in Northern Nigeria.
17 Yahaya, *Hausa a Rubuce*..., p. 95.
18 Ibid., pp. 97–108.
19 Adamu, *Print and Broadcast*..., p. 2.
In 2006 there were 10 press titles in Hausa available on the Nigerian market, one among them, *Aljifir*, was published also in *ajami* script. The press market in Nigeria was relatively stable and it experienced constant development. The factor that has altered this state of affairs was connected to the global arch-enemy of the printed press, the prevalence of widespread Internet connection. Gradually press publications were wiped out and among the victims of modernization was their long-time leader, *Gaskiya*. Currently the leading newspaper in Hausa is *Aminiya*, published once a week by Media Trust, a Nigerian media giant from Abuja. However, there is still some hope for the ‘paper’ press and this hope lies in the richly illustrated magazines published monthly or quarterly.

The possibilities for spreading cultural norms through the press are obviously limited by the character of this medium. During the *Gaskiya* era, newspapers were not only news presenters, as they also published poems and political pamphlets. Today, with the appearance of colorful magazines, they maintain a trendsetting function. By covering the lifestyles of the local celebrities, these magazines stayed up to date with current trends in fashion and popular culture. They also correspond with other more popular forms of media. *Fim (Film)* is one of the examples. Concentrated on the Northern movie market, it describes and reviews new productions and gives some insight into the lives of actors and presents their opinions through interviews.

**Radio and television**

The problems that blighted the printed media market, were not so applicable for other media sources, especially radio. Radio broadcast was heard in Nigeria for the first time on 19 December 1932, when colonial administration arranged a retransmission of a BBC programme. In 1939 the first radio station was opened in Ibadan and this also corresponded with the aforementioned Yahaya statement about British countermeasures against Nazi propaganda. In 1944 a revolution in communication came to the Northern part of the colony, when the first radio station was inaugurated in Kano. Soon it was followed by others and within five years Kaduna, Jos and Zaria were able to provide their own broadcasting services. The process was hastened after the country became independent from Britain. Both Federal and State owned radio stations were

---


opened, and later they were joined by private media companies. This was linked to the parliamentary proclamation from 1992, which allowed the founding of radio and TV stations from private accounts. Although in 1999 there was only one private radio station, the transition from military to civilian rule opened the door for private investors. New radio stations started to appear like toads on rainy Sunday and currently there are many of them, operating in major Northern cities. Among the most popular today is Freedom Radio, established in 2003 in Kano, with regional branches in Dutse, Kaduna, Maiduguri and Sokoto. A sister station\(^\text{22}\) of Freedom Radio is Dala FM, that has its headquarters in Kano and regional branches in other Northern cities. Another one is Rahma FM, established in 2011 in Kano and now available also in Kaduna, Katsina, Gombe, Bauchi and Jigawa. These stations provide their service in Hausa, and with the use of the Internet streaming, their programs are also available abroad, thus becoming a useful source of information for a Hausa diaspora. They also supplement the stream of the international broadcasters like BBC, Voice of America and Deutsche Velle, giving more insight into the everyday affairs of the Hausa community.

Apart from the radio stations that broadcast in Hausa, there are some popular private stations, that broadcast in English. One of these is the Jos based Unity FM, that spreads the message of peaceful coexistence of cultures and religions. Another one is Wazobia FM. Founded in Lagos in 2007, this radio station clearly refers to the concept of *wazobia*, the idea of intercultural and interethnic cooperation for the benefit of the Nigerian Federation. The term is made of three words, each meaning “come” in three major Nigerian languages,\(^\text{23}\) while the language in which all the programs are presented is Pidgin English, which serves here as a vehicular language in a multiethnic society.

In the era of new media, radio is doing particularly well in Nigeria, as it can provide a most reliable and stable service. It indirectly benefits from some general Nigerian problems of inefficiency. This is because the constant lack of electricity, even in the major cities, can prevent people from watching television as not everyone can afford a constantly running generator, and recurring problems with mobile networks can cut people off from Internet databases. In these circumstances, what is of prime importance is that a ‘good, old’ cheap radio set powered by two batteries can provide entertainment for a long time, and signal coverage reaches even the remote rural areas.

The history of television in Northern Nigeria is slightly different. It dates back to the era of colonial administration, but the development of this medium

---

\(^{22}\) Both radio stations not only share the same building in Kano’s Sharada district, but also have similar logos with a singing budgie.

was carried on by the government of the new, independent Republic. On 31 October 1959, the first TV signal was broadcast in Ibadan. It was an initiative of the Western Region government and was actually a result of political debate and increasing need for free media.  

This event is historically important, as it was not only the first TV broadcast in Nigeria, but also the first one in the whole of Sub-Saharan Africa. After independence, Nigeria witnessed clear progress in the area of media services. Both state and federal government soon opened their own TV stations. In the North it was RTV Kaduna (Radio-Television Kaduna), and soon after, regional branches were opened in major northern cities.

1993 was the year, when first concessions to private owners were granted by General Ibrahim Babangida. The privatization of the media market not only opened the door for the local investors, but also for international broadcasters and satellite television became more and more popular, thus attracting the attention of Nigerian viewers by moving their interest away from the offers of the local TV operators.

When it comes to media content and the promotion of cultural norms, television has the highest impact among the “old media” forms. It is quite obvious, as this medium is highly visual, and its absorption by the viewers is easy and somehow automatic. It can promote music through videos, storytelling through film and drama and social norms through interviews, talk shows and documentary productions. However, in the Nigerian reality, radio seems to be more important as it is more mobile and does not depend on the unstable supply of electricity.

Radio here does not have any important competition from abroad, as the most popular international services provide their broadcast in Hausa and are trying to maintain high standards of cultural sensitivity. This could not be said about the offer of the satellite television operators. Being independent from local regulations for the media content, satellite TV networks do not hesitate to show Hollywood blockbusters or reality shows and the most popular channels provide live broadcasts of football matches from European leagues. That means that not only Hausa, but also Nigerian content is very limited, and some of the operators do not have any Hausa channels in their catalogue.

**New media**

The novelty character of the “new media” lies in its interactivity. The user defines which content he wants to receive. He can comment on it, share it with

---


25 Like ‘ArabSat’ for example.
other users and in some cases he can also participate in the process of its creation. It is hard to avoid some simplification in this short definition, as some of the abovementioned features can apply also to the “old media”, while more and more TV stations provide their service on-demand and Internet radio stations allow users to shuffle between tracks to find their favorites. Thus, the Internet is the key to understanding the idea of the modernization of media, because apart from being a medium itself, it forces change onto the older media forms.

In the case of Nigeria, spreading of the Internet is closely connected with the development of the telecommunication market and mobile network. In 2001 in Nigeria there were only 500,000 registered phone lines, covering both land and mobile. Internet usage was significantly smaller, as only 113,280 of Nigerians were connected to the global network. It amounted to just 2.5 per cent of a population of 126 million. In 2014, just 13 years later, 67,101,452 registered users had Internet connection accounting for around 40 per cent of a population of 178 million. Nowadays Nigeria is the 8th largest Internet user in the World.26

This revolution in communication is clearly linked with the development of the mobile network. All of the major telecommunication providers, like Airtel, Etisalat, GLO or MTN provide Internet services and a recharge of data can be easily done by a pre-paid card. The same, that can be used for voice recharging. Accessibility seems to be one of the main factors and the difference in the number of Internet users between Nigeria and Cameroon, can be used as an example. In Cameroon, where the system of data recharging is much more complicated and requires the help of an authorized dealer, estimated number of users are significantly smaller. In 2014 there were just 1,486,815 registered users, and that meant that only 6.52 per cent of a population of around 23 million had Internet connection at the time.27 Third party participation clearly limits the usage of the Internet to the cities, as the salesmen, even if present in the villages, rarely have the tools and skills needed to perform data recharging processes.

However, the abovementioned data should only be considered as approximate estimations. People who are not registered as Internet users can still reach the Network through internet cafés, and thus the number of people who have access to Internet content would in reality be higher. From another point of view, the number of users in Nigeria is clearly exaggerated. Regarding the inefficiency of the mobile network in this country and the constant breakups of service, it is certain that a percentage of the abovementioned 67 million are the same users counted twice, or even more times. Mobile service availability circulates

26 http://www.internetlivestats.com/internet-users/nigeria/ (accessed 8 October 2015). At the day of access, the above mentioned website estimated the number of Internet users in Nigeria at 78 452 000.

between various operators like electricity between various districts of Kano. A natural reaction of the users is to secure for themselves two or three mobile lines, and to switch to whichever operator is available at the moment.

This data is not completely relevant, but it certainly shows the scale of Internet usage in Nigeria. Even if we say that roughly 30 per cent of the population are active Internet users, it still gives us a significant number of people who have unlimited access to the uncensored database that provides various forms of entertainment and various sources of information. If we go further and notice, that these people are active members of society, we can see here huge potential for the transmission of the new cultural norms, that have been literally downloaded from the Internet. Moreover, those influences change the expectations of the viewers and force media broadcasters to modify the content of TV and radio transmission to reflect those changes and satisfy the viewers. To clarify this statement, main trends in Hausa popular culture will be studied below.

Main trends in Hausa popular culture

As far as contemporary Hausa popular culture is concerned we can observe three main patterns. The older is obviously the traditional one, but there are also Western influences and Indian counter-flows, as defined by Abdalla Uba Adamu. What is significant for Northern Nigeria, or for Africa in general, is the strong role of tradition in the era of modernity. As it was disputed above, it could be linked to the relatively late and forced colonialism, that could have led to a dichotomy when “western” or “colonial” meant oppressive, and “traditional” was “indigenous” or “original”. It is visible in the works of many African writers from the post-independence era, like for example in Chinua Achebe’s *Arrow of God*. Similar processes can be observed in many other, non-westernized countries, where tradition is still strong and changes stimulated by western influences occur not because of conquest, but because of a soft-power approach. In Northern Nigeria, cultural colonialism was made peacefully by Islamic scholars and traders and thus redefined Hausa meaning of the term “traditional”. So Hausa, or Hausa-Fulani culture, taking into account the mixing of Fulani elites with Hausa society after the Dan Fodio jihad. Hausa-Fulani culture is almost purely Islamic. But there are still many elements incorporated from the oral literature into modern popular culture.

It is reasonable to claim that when it comes to lyrics, Hausa songs are the new oral literature. It works for both classical musicians and newcomers alike. Their lyrics unless recorded are usually not written, and the main components of the songs are its musical background and poetry. It is hard to argue with Sai’du Muhammad Gusau’s claim, that modern music does not follow traditional instrumentation, but it is reasonable as well to follow his statement about links between modern lyrics and traditional forms of oral expression. Hausa musicians naturally incorporate elements of oral literature and frequently use some short, traditional forms. One of the examples are proverbs (karin magana), the other one are praise epithets (kirari) used as a form of self-recognition.

However, classical Hausa music is still popular and it is easy to buy CDs or Video CDs with recorded performances of popular Hausa traditional musicians like the abovementioned Dan Maraya Jos, Mamman Shata, Musa Dan Kwairo and others. Those three musicians are now deceased, and there may not be many people who are willing to follow their path, but it is too early to say that traditional music has died with them. It is not hard to find a 20 year old student, who will know by heart the songs of Mamman Shata, and who will be performing them with skills and passion. Traditional music is also developing, separately from global trends in popular culture. The works of Kano based singer and poet Dini Murmushi can serve as an example. Moreover, by his melodic recitations of the lyrics, he actually creates a bridge between traditional music and the modern hip-hop movement.

Tradition is visible in every aspect of Hausa society, starting from ways of thinking, right through to fashion and festivities. Thus the statement, that in the era of mobile phones, plasma TV screens and global media flows, Hausa society is still very much traditional, can be justified. However it is also true to say that culture, as long as it is alive and practised, is a dynamic phenomenon and is prone to changes brought by foreign contra-flows. Hausa culture is not an exception, but because of the tradition, the content presented by the mainstream media has to be carefully selected, and this media while creating new trends, at the same time have to refer to social context.

That is one of the reasons why western cultural products have to be “translated” into Hausa culture before implementation. The process dates

---

30 Adamu, ‘Imperialism from Below…’
31 It is reflected in the Hausa language, where the word “waka” means both song and poem.
32 There are some exceptions, like the song Masoiya performed by the Accra based group Hausa Hip-Hop Empire. Although it is modernized, the very astetic musical background of this track is actually following a traditional drum pattern.
back to the early 1930s and the efforts of the Translation Bureau, to create an indigenous westernized novel and thus support Western education whilst inspiring the traditions of reading in Hausa society. After the literary contest organized in 1934, five books were published and they are all now considered as all-time Hausa classics. After numerous re-editions, they are still available on the market. Among them was *Ruwan Bagaja* [Healing Water] written by Abubakar Imam. This novel is particularly important as it shows the ways of how foreign elements could be incorporated into a Hausa cultural setting. The main inspiration for the author came from reading *Maqamat Al-Hariri*, so the storyline circulates around the rivalry of the protagonist and his trickster-type adversary. Apart from the Arabic influence, there are clearly visible Western influences. The title of the book, as well as some core plot elements, is taken from *The Brothers Grimm Fairy Tales* especially *The Water of Life*. Thus, we can follow the statement made by Abdalla Uba Adamu, that the efforts of Abubakar Imam mark the transition from *Istanci* – the direct translation of literary works, into *Imamanci* – the “transmutation” of foreign literature into the Hausa mindset. It is even more visible in the Imam’s *opus magnum* — *Magana Jari Ce*, which is a composition of various international elements and stories. The inspirations include *One Thousand and One Nights*, Indian *Panchatantra*, Brothers Grimm, Hans Christian Andersen, Persian stories, Greek mythology, The Bible and even Boccacio’s *Decameron*, which gave birth to seven stories.

The popularity of Abubakar Imam’s work shows the potential for careful and skillful adaptation, or the translation of foreign cultural products into the Hausa social context. This trend is still visible and reaches almost all forms of modern popular culture, when not only the form but also the content of the particular cultural product is adapted.

The contest from 1934 was a turning point for modern Hausa literature. Those first books not only inspired new generations of authors, but also became a trans-genre phenomenon. Just like *Shaihu Umar* [Sheikh Umar] written by Abubakar Tafawa Balewa. This book was later converted into a play and then into a movie, directed by Adamu Halilu. Although greatly suffering from piracy, the Hausa literature market has been in constant development, and new genres have been reflecting the needs and interests of the readers. When time passes, the stories about the importance of education, health issues and other social

---

34 This text is widely available in Northern Nigeria and is a part of the advanced course of Arabic grammar in Hausa Muslim Education. See: Abdalla Uba Adamu, *Transglobal Media Flows and African Popular Culture. Revolution and Reaction in Muslim Hausa Popular Culture*, Kano: Visually Ethnographic Productions, 2008, p. 17.

35 Ibid., p. 18

36 Ibid., pp. 18–19.
topics have been supplanted by love stories that became the main pattern of the so-called “market literature”, known in Hausa as “littattafan soyayya” (books about love). The importance of literary market started to diminish when the video market emerged, along with the idea of the home cinema. The movies are more dynamic and much easier to absorb and the presence of song and dance routines makes them more entertaining.

Western trends are available also in music and cinema, but here we can talk also about transmission through intermediates, as many trends are coming from the southern part of the country. Southern Nigerian musicians and movie makers are taking their inspiration from American music and cinema, but their work inspires some of the artists from the North to follow the southern trends. However despite the influences are visible, their works are still original. The whole genre of ‘technopop’, or melodic rap could serve as an example with the works of Billy O, Abdullahi Mighty, some tracks of Double Trouble, Mixterbash, Hazy D-Star, M.M. Haruna and many others. What is worth pointing out here is that the abovementioned musicians refer to themselves as “rappers”, and the originality of their music justifies the term “melodic rap”. Apart from ‘technopop’ the Hausa hip-hop movement also has a more Westernized face, as the abovementioned musicians along with other artists like Nomiiis Gee, Dr. Pure and the recently disbanded K-Boys or Ziriums to name just few, also perform a more “hardcore”, MTV style hip-hop. Those trends, although relatively new are already starting to change Hausa society and inspire young people to create their own music or just to adopt the style of the hip-hop stars. The music is also featured in radio and TV shows, and thus becomes more accessible.

Western inspirations are also visible in Hausa cinema. Although they are not dominant, we can distinguish three forms of their appearance — transmutation, incorporation and reaction. Transmutation in cinema means the same thing as in literature. It is a translation of the particular cultural product. This process is perfectly visible on the example of the movie Masoyiyata. Titanic directed by Ashu Brown and released in 2005. The title of the film is not misleading. The movie not only contains many scenes joyfully cut out from the original Hollywood release, but also features a Hausa version of the song My Heart Will Go On, originally sung by Celine Dion.

38 Adamu, Transglobal Media Flows..., p. 71.
39 The shows are actually run by musicians. Nomiiis Gee has his own show on the Arewa24 TV station available on the satellite platform Nilesat, while Billy O, Hassan M. Sharif (ex K-Boys, now retired) and Dr. Pure are running the programs on Dala.FM, Freedom Radio and Rahma Radio respectively.
Incorporation, can be understood as an acquisition of the particular elements during the process of creation of the new cultural product. In Kannywood, i.e. the Hausa movie market, it is visible in a cautious breakthrough from the dominant topics and genres. It means, that although most of the 500 movies produced yearly in Northern Nigeria are telling stories about love, which are much admired by the viewers, there are some movies that are going beyond the genre of melodrama or romantic comedy. One of them is the horror movie Gudan Jini [Running Spirit] released in 2015.

The most universal among the abovementioned patterns is “reaction”. This sub-genre in Hausa cinema flexibly moves between various movie topics, thus appearing in melodrama and crime stories alike. The main feature here is the educational value of the movie, when the storyline presents the conflict between the Western style of life and Hausa Muslim tradition. It goes without saying that the decadence of the Westernized lifestyle is exaggerated while the traditional way of life is favored. One of the examples is NAS, a movie with Adamu A. Zango that was released in 2014. The four hour film presents the transformation of the protagonist from a drug abusing, drunkard criminal into a pious Muslim.

The pattern of “reaction” does not concern the strongest and most influential wave of cultural contra-flows. This can be seen with the impact of Hindu Cinema on Hausa popular culture. Hindu movies appeared in Northern Nigeria during colonial times, and gained in popularity after independence. Initially, their distribution was limited to Lebanese owned cinema houses, and thus the number of potential viewers was limited. In Hausa society, women are excluded from participation in cinema screening, and those who frequently go to the cinema could be branded as prostitutes. Thus, Hindi movies were watched and the patterns from Hindi songs were adapted for the Hausa language. The biggest boom time for this kind of cinema occurred in the 1970s, and was linked to the development of the TV Stations. Between 1976 and 2003 NTA Kano alone has shown 1,176 movies from the Indian Subcontinent. The process was hastened by the growing availability of video and later DVD players. It created a wider market for Hindi cinema, as now women and youths were able to watch the movies in the seclusion of their houses.

---


41 A detailed study about Hindu contra-flows in literature can be found in: Abdalla Uba Adamu, ‘Loud Bubbles from a Silent Brook: Trends and Tendencies in Contemporary Hausa Prose Writing’, Research in African Literatures, Vol. 37, No. 3, 2006; cinema and music: Adamu, Transglobal Media Flows...

42 Adamu, Transglobal Media Flows…, p. 38.
Hindi cinema has influenced Hausa society on almost every level,\textsuperscript{43} because it has been considered more appealing than American culture and more entertaining than Arabic or Persian one. In the consciousness of the Hausa viewers Hindi culture presented in the movies, shares a lot of similarities with Hausa society. This can be seen starting from the dress code, right through to the lifestyle and the presentation of the main topics, especially in terms of the conscious approach towards inter-gender relations. Even though the people do not understand the meaning of lyrics, and the fact that Hindu culture is in fact polytheistic has had very little significance. It could be illustrated as an example by the song \textit{Har Har Mahadev} from the movie \textit{Rani Rupmati}. Originally, the song was praising Lord Shiva, but the common street adaptation misinterpreted the meaning of the name Mahadev and was praising Mahdi instead.\textsuperscript{44} Thus, the main impact was made not by Hindu beliefs and ceremonies, but by Hindu films and soundtrack music. Initially, it was an influence on Hausa literature, where many stories were borrowed from Hindi cinema, but the influence was transferred also to other media forms. It is hard to find any Hausa movie produced today that does not include song and dance routines, and the music itself has inspired local markets. The dominant style now in Hausa pop music is \textit{nanaye}\textsuperscript{45} which is linked to Hausa soundtrack music, which in turn borrowed many elements from Hindi songs. Even styles of singing are modified during postproduction, to reflect the styles of singers known from the movies. \textit{Nanaye} is a separate genre with distinctive features, but even some hip-hop musicians like Billy O and emerging artists like M.M. Haruna, flexibly move between different styles and some of them, like Almajiran Zaman Lafiya, are mixing \textit{nanaye} with western-style rapping.

Local movie market is now well developed but Hindi movies are still popular. They are even available in the Hausa language, as some companies like the Jos based \textit{Usmaniyya Movies} are selling them in dubbed versions. Moreover, particularly devoted sympathizers of the Indian culture can now learn Hindi, thanks to the self-study handbooks written by Nazeer Magoga, who in turn had learned the language from movies. It is clearly a kind of a cultural circle.


\textsuperscript{44} Adamu, \textit{Transglobal Media Flows}…, p. 39.

\textsuperscript{45} It is sometimes translated as “blues” as stated by Billy O during personal communication with the author, but the term itself is an ideophone.
Conclusion

Hausa popular culture is a living phenomenon, and as with every culture it is in a state of constant transition. Some changes are already made, but it is too early to say whether all of them will have an irreversible cultural impact. What is most important here is that the cultural flows that do not fit into traditional mindset are simply rejected, and can only succeed if they are modified to suit the social context. Hausa/Fulani society is traditional, and people respect their cultural heritage. They are curious about novelties and many of them, especially the youth, stay up to date with modern global trends, but that doesn’t mean that these flows will wipe out tradition and social norms. It is true that the tradition of oral storytelling is declining, but society has already taken some counter measures. The recently revived Nigerian Folklore Society which has its headquarters in Kano, is working to preserve traditional tales, and inspire scholarly interest towards this area of Nigerian culture.\footnote{Traditional society also has some punishment ‘sticks’ that can be used when the incentive ‘carrot’ is not enough. The State Censorship Board Law from 2001 and The Cinematography and Licensing Regulation from the same year give the government measures for action if a particular artist decides to promote pornography, obscenities and immoral behavior. A movie can be banned from distribution, and a song can be added to the blacklist of tracks restricted by radio stations. The interpretation is up to the Censorship Board officials, and their verdict could be deemed as surprising if the particular “obscene” product would be compared with those from the Western hemisphere. Sometimes just a slight criticism of the government or society is considered enough to cause unpredicted problems for the artist. The arrests of Adamu Zango and Dan Ibro can serve as an example. That is why some artists such as Ziriums, decided to leave Nigeria and pursue their career abroad, but at the same time they still maintain contact with the local market. With the songs available on-line, Ziriums can spread his message in a way that would not be possible if he had decided to stay and release his album on the local market. Even with widespread piracy, there is still a huge possibility that the CD would be banned.}

The struggle between freedom of speech and social restrictions has lead to another distinctive feature of Hausa popular culture — the consciousness of speech and expression. A Hausa artist will not swear, he will not abuse members of society and he will not promote behavior restricted by Islam, even if he is

\textsuperscript{46} NFS Chairman, Bukar Usman has recently published a huge collection of Hausa translations of Bura tales (See: Bukar Usman, \textit{Taskar Tatsuniyoyi} (A box of stories), Kano: Gidan Dabino Publishers, 2012), and the Society is active, thanks to the direct participation and publications of many prominent Nigerian scholars.
a ‘hard-core’ rapper who is talking about poverty and whose inspirations are ‘gangsta-rap’ stars from the USA. However this self-censorship comes naturally, as Hausa society respects its elders and respects its religion. The artist will thus ridicule, but not abuse, he will criticize, but not incite violence. This is a ‘give and take’ situation, and maybe in time this approach will create more space for those trends in popular culture which are now condemned by traditional society.
Post-Colonial Feminine Emancipation in Bole Butake’s *Lake God* (1986) and *And Palm-Wine Will Flow* (1990)

**Abstract**

This paper sets out to discuss the platform that women, as characters and major performers in Bole Butake’s *Lake God* (1986 [1999]) and *And Palm-Wine Will Flow* (1990 [1999]), occupy to liberate not only themselves from patriarchal structures, but also their communities from unscrupulous and irrational political leaderships. In a bid to engage with notions of resistance, the paper comments on the customary circumstances of the female characters before they – the women – engage themselves on the path to emancipation. Also, in order to succinctly situate and clearly define the status of female characters in the mentioned plays, the paper further engages with specific concepts of postcolonial critical discourse to portray women as objects who out of necessity to assert their identity, reject objectification in favour of agency.

**Introduction**

Most women in strict patriarchal communities have in the past been the subject of varied forms of discrimination. Discrimination is employed here in the context of what some androcentric cultures have conceived of them. The word, “woman,” often conjures specific terms such as feminist, female, and feminine. Relating to feminist debates, attempts have been made to differentiate between these three formulations.\(^2\) Toril Moi is referenced for underlining that “the first is ‘a political position,’ the second ‘a matter of biology,’ and the third ‘a set of culturally defined characteristics’.”\(^3\) Although these terminologies may be employed to investigate the experiences of women in specific geographical and cultural settings, they also put in perspective women’s general concerns. These concerns, as one may guess, are related to certain biological, cultural,
political, economic, and social constraints that might have provoked them to reconstruct their identity.

Plays that tackle indigenous themes could be seen as a media form which comments on post-colonial politics and the liberation of women. It has, therefore, been the priority of some contemporary Cameroonian playwrights to highlight women’s experiences in both indigenous and post-colonial settings in some of their works. Although this assertion may appear contradictory, it however presents ingenious ways in which authors do not only highlight biases against women in strict cultural communities, but have employed cultural media to raise issues that clearly differentiate their statuses from those of men folk. These issues resonate in socio-political and cultural debates that animate post-colonial Cameroonian politics, and in many ways have helped to differentiate and redefine women’s efforts to liberate themselves from different degrees of oppression. These circumstances have motivated some Cameroonian dramatists to foreground women who would opt for remarkably mutinous ways to liberate themselves and their communities from unscrupulous and Machiavellian political rule. Since Cameroon is considered the predominant setting for our arguments, this paper a) presents an overview of women’s statuses in two Anglophone Cameroon plays, b) focuses on the parameters that the women have employed to emancipate themselves from oppression, and c) investigates how this emancipation process partially or fully corresponds with those that have taken place in contemporary Cameroonian politics. Thus, Lake God (1986 [1999]) and And Palm-Wine Will Flow (1990 [1999]) by Bole Butake, a renowned male Anglophone playwright, are interesting examples.

Women’s experiences in indigenous and post-colonial contexts

If it is affirmed that “more than three quarters of the people living in the world today have had their lives shaped by the experience of colonialism” then it would not be an exaggeration to say that more than \( \frac{3}{4} \) of women in the world today have had their lives touched in one way or other by patriarchy. Patriarchy is compared to colonialism, considering men’s suppression of women in some African cultures. There is no doubt that a cross section of post-colonial Cameroonian women face a number of challenges that have emerged either from negative traditional practices or from contemporary power politics. Negative traditional practices may have spanned centuries, but more recent

---

forms of discrimination against women have emerged with the impact of colonial administration. This statement resonates previous views that:

[... in pre-colonial Africa, power was wielded by old men who exercised monopolies over ‘ritual knowledge’ to which younger men were gradually permitted access as they grew older. [...] ritual knowledge was the anvil on which pre-colonial political power rested [...]. With the emergence of colonial rule [...], Western education supplanted this older order, providing a new basis for political power. The initial beneficiaries of this new ‘magic’ were young men who eventually rose to the upper echelons of power when the colonialists departed.]

Therefore, women’s status in male-dominated communities has, prompted responses from local researches on gender. Some of these researches specify that women are envisaged and defined as traditional objects “by natives”.

The term “native”, as conceived in this context, deviates from what connotes the “original”, the “indigenous”, or the “pre-industrial”, denoting actions that could be judged as barbaric. This implies that perpetrators – indigenous and post-colonial “natives”– of discriminatory practices against women persistently search for avenues to further subjugate them. Efforts made by women to question these challenges, either in texts or authentic communities, have in many ways redefined their identity in patriarchal traditional and post-colonial communities, including Cameroon.

Patriarchy is thus a traditional, colonial, and post-colonial mal-practice. Focusing on the traditional, many Cameroonian women, especially in rural areas have experienced traditional practices which do not favour their full participation in the cultural, political, and social life of their communities. Specific examples from the North-West region of Cameroon include male community members who do not allow their women to inherit land and own property. The men’s argument is that women, through their bridal wealth, are considered property and are therefore not allowed by tradition to inherit property. Women in this community are also judged as “stateless” and therefore

---


must not inherit land which is considered static. Customary inheritance practices that deny some Cameroonian women the right to inherit land and own property have classified them as mere cultivators and not owners of land. Since men are managers of community land and property, women’s access to such wealth is possible only with the consent of local authorities, their husbands and other male family members. Given that customary courts, generally, do not favour women, they therefore do not intervene to ease women’s rights and/or desires to own land and property; these courts that should intervene when such rights are violated, abound with men. Besides this deprivation with regards to land and property ownership, early and forced marriages, betrothal at birth, deplorable widowhood rites, lack of education and Female Genital Mutilation (F.G.M.) are some of the other societal ills against women that are also deeply rooted in gender discriminations and have added to practices that have, so far, infringed on women’s rights and benefits in Cameroon.

As mentioned earlier, colonialism inspired certain practices that further contravened the rights of women. This assertion supports claims that Western penetration of Africa was a gendered process, since it is argued that the colonisers may have inherited traits that favoured the violation of women’s inalienable rights. Such claims stipulate that the colonial administration had an inherent male-dominated character which emerged from a history of gender violence in Europe from the middles ages, right up to the women’s movement in the 1960s. Specific cases of gender violence include “[…] witch-hunts and inquisitions of the Middle Ages [and how] several million women were systematically dismembered, disfigured, and tortured before being drowned or burned alive”.9

From these revelations, one may posit that that the oppression of women in the West had a direct bearing on the treatment of women during and after colonialism. With specific reference to post-colonial Cameroon, the following statistics, particularly, illustrate her misrepresentation in the current political arena:

From the time of independence [1960] to the present day, no woman has held the post of Prime Minister or the Speaker of the House of Assembly. The statistics of the August 2000 Ministerial Cabinet present a disproportionate allocation of ministerial posts between men and women.

---


9 Mama, ‘Sheroes and Villains…’, p. 254.
women. Of the six Ministers of State, none were women, of the twenty-three Ministers, just two were women, and among the six Minister Delegates only one was a woman.¹⁰

Given that men controlled indigenous political power, a seemingly patriarchal pre-colonial power structure inherited a male-dominated colonial administration. Such political administrations did not encourage women to make decisions concerning the functioning of indigenous, colonial and consequently, post-colonial institutions, influencing and causing most women to conceive of themselves more as mothers and child bearers, as opposed to political actors. Therefore, discriminative circumstances emerging from traditional, colonial, and post-colonial structures have, in fact, prompted African feminist critics to judge the women’s dilemma as “the double-double quarrel”.¹¹ A quarrel that can be illustrated in the following manner:

Figure 1: The “double-double quarrel” tangle

---

¹⁰ Samba, Women in Theatre for Development in Cameroon…, p. 18.
¹¹ Juliana Makuchi Nfah-Abbenyi, ‘Flabberwhelmed or Turning History on Its Head: The Postcolonial Woman-as-Subject in Aidoo’s Changes: A Love Story’, in Emerging Perspectives on
Perhaps women’s “double, double quarrel”, together with institutions that do not value their interests, were factors that encouraged Butake to write and direct *Lake God* and *And Palm-Wine Will Flow*. These plays have not only portrayed women’s attempts *en route* to emancipation, but have also, in a very subtle way, questioned their role in politics and in contemporary Cameroonian fiction. Consequently, the plays have provided a point of interest to some contemporary literary critics who in the process of investigating the gap that generally exists between the “centre” and the “periphery,” have fairly analysed discriminative practices against women in Cameroon.\(^{12}\) Notions behind the “centre” and the “periphery” reflect historical and theoretical debates implicated in post-colonial discourse. Focusing on issues of identity and representation, these concepts have been deployed traditionally to define the complex *rapport* between what is known as the “imperial centre and the colonial periphery.” The power play between these two categories, some feminists argue, could be employed to investigate the relationship between women and male-dominated institutions.

Critics’ interest in *Lake God* and *And Palm-Wine Will Flow* and most of Butake’s other works,\(^{13}\) is strongly motivated by the political situation in the country, especially as far back as the early 1990s. Their focus has been on the contribution of women to Cameroon’s politics.\(^{14}\) Women have employed rituals


of resistance as a way to express their concerns and as a form of protest against political injustice and repression. The launching of the Social Democratic Front (SDF), a major opposition political party, on 26 May 1990 in Bamenda, reintroduced multiparty politics in Cameroon. They had been banned by the French colonial administration before Cameroon’s independence in 1960. The action of the women developed from the launching of the SDF, to the presidential elections in 1992, during which the SDF vehemently contested the victory of the ruling Cameroon People’s Democratic Party (CPDM). The contention included violent actions such as the burning down of CPDM members homes and businesses by SDF supporters. In the aftermath of post-election violence in Bamenda, the Takumbeng women’s cult came out in protest marches over what they claimed were the unlawful killing of innocent civilians by the military. Fully in support of the SDF, the Takumbeng women positioned themselves as guards to protect its chairman Ni John Fru Ndi, when a state of emergency was imposed in Bamenda and Fru Ndi was put under house arrest. The Takumbeng women supported the SDF because they believed that it represented justice, peace and honesty, as opposed to the ruling CPDM party. It is noteworthy to add that the CPDM had been in power since 1982, and subsequently became unpopular in the eyes of the majority of Cameroonians. The Takumbeng women presented themselves naked during protest marches, with “a large blades of grass gripped in between their mouths symbolizing ‘no talk but action’”.15 Their naked bodies embodied mystical powers that spelt ill luck and death on those whom they judged as defaulters of a democratic process. It is believed that specific rituals were performed prior to the cult’s public appearance. Such appearances aimed at curbing the repressive action of the military, which had allegedly been dispatched by the regime in power to brutally suppress civilians during post-election violence. The Takumbeng women’s cult, it is of interest to add, was an amalgamation of mostly post-menopausal women from different secret societies based in villages in the North-west province. Their protest marches challenged the ruling elite by questioning the democratic process and at the same time acting as a strategy to prove their strength. The cult’s contribution in containing the 1992 post-election violence resonates with the rebellion of women16 in Butake’s plays.


16 And Palm Wine Will Flow was first performed and published before the launching of the SDF.
Situating theoretical debates in women’s experiences

Besides blaming the colonisers for supplanting indigenous patriarchy with inherited forms of gender violence, patriarchy, as highlighted earlier, has also been forms of coerced labour and repression that colonies experienced under decades of European incursion. This comparison, which has summarily been described as “patriarchal imperialism”17 affirms the view that women:

[...] share with other colonized races and peoples an intimate experience of the politics of oppression and repression, and like them they have been forced to articulate their experiences in the language of their oppressors.18

The “intimate experience” shared by the colonised race and women, mentioned above, is certainly characterised by defeat, marginalisation, contorted lives, and stifled voices. Marginalised women, who are prevalent in Butake’s plays, have equally adopted both resistant and rebellious means to combat undesirable forces against them. What underlies their mode of combat is an attempt to reconstruct their identity, with remarkable nationalistic intentions.

But comparing the plight of women under patriarchy to colonial subjects, may not be appealing to some critics. It has been debated that, “the coupling of the postcolonial and women [...] almost inevitably leads to the simplicities that underlie unthinking celebrations of oppression [...]”.19 Furthermore, the coalition between feminist theory and post-colonial theory is a “dangerous democracy” in which “each term serves to reify the potential pietism of the other”.20 Since the post-colonial theory has been employed to analyse literature that emerges from nations that had once experienced some form of colonialism – Cameroon being one of them – its application to literature, that foregrounds the plight of women vis-à-vis their experiences with patriarchy, could be justified, given that oppressed women are often presented as occupants of the periphery. In this connection, they are dominated by the centre (the men) and in this way their experiences contribute to discourses linked to the “other” and the “othering”.

20 Ibid., p. 274.
The “periphery” and the “centre” are therefore, highlighted in literature that foregrounds the emancipation of women. And women in such literature take centre stage to fight not only for their emancipation, but also to obliterate other forms of oppression existing in their world. This assertion is clearly lived in *Lake God* and *And Palm-Wine Will Flow* in which women (the periphery) take up an unusual step not only to challenge the centre, but also to bridge the gap between the “periphery” and the “centre”. Their venture, conspicuously rebellious, is in a bid to assert their identity and in doing so liberate themselves and other marginalised groups based in their communities. Their rebellion begins with negotiating with institutions that represent customary practices as evidenced in the plays. When their venture at negotiation becomes either problematic or is ignored, they immediately engage in practices which, more or less, obliterate the centre.

**An overview of plays**

*Lake God* and *And Palm-Wine Will Flow* are Butake’s comments on corruption, autocracy, and greed. These vices also rule the political scene in some post-colonial states in Africa, including Cameroon. Both plays are informed by “misogynist” political leaderships which do not take issues concerning the poor majority, particularly women, as matters of importance. As a result, these leaderships are unpopular in the eyes of the communities in both plays. Butake’s ‘*Lake God*’ is about Fon Joseph Kimbong, a corrupt leader who does not bother about the socio-economic, cultural and political well being of his citizens. Fon Kimbong bribes his way to the throne, by offering to the “king-makers […] money and meat”.\(^{21}\) Everything Fon Kimbong does contradicts the general perception of a traditional ruler who is supposed to be “the spiritual leader and custodian of all traditions of its subjects” as well as “one who ensures that the ‘public’ goals of the society are delivered”.\(^{22}\) On the contrary, Fon Kimbong is an illegitimate ruler who utilises his political position to excel in an unorthodox extortion of wealth from the community. Firstly, the Fon sells out large portions of community land to Fulani cattle herdsmen, without consulting the people. His actions explain why he rejects the idea of providing both settlements and grazing land for them, and particularly to Dewa whose cattle are known to devastate community farmlands. The community, especially its women, cannot cultivate crops since the cattle destroy these crops, particularly corn. Both the


destruction of crops and the Fon’s unscrupulous selling of portions of land, results in social unrest in families throughout the community. This unrest also destabilizes the agricultural output of the community, on which its livelihood is based. Secondly, the Fon’s myopic embrace of Western religion – epitomised in the play by the character of Father Leo – makes him disregard the importance of pacifying the gods of the lake. It is worth mentioning that Father Leo encourages the Fon to ban the indigenous religion and openly rebukes the women for taking lead roles in such religious functions. The Fon’s rejection of traditional worship is portrayed through his description of it as heathen and barbaric. His attitude towards traditional worship strains his relationship with Shey Bo-Nyo (the Chief Priest) and the Seven Pillars of Kwifon. These traditional authorities attempt to caution the Fon about the deadly repercussions of ignoring the annual sacrifice, required to pacify the gods. The Fon’s defiance provokes the gods’ anger which results in the boiling and explosion of the lake. This disaster decimates almost all living creatures in the community, together with rats and flies.\textsuperscript{23} Despite the tragedy in the play, the women’s role in asserting their socio-cultural and political identity remains fundamental.

The images of socio-political and cultural unrest that Butake creates in \textit{Lake God}, become images of revolution and victory in \textit{And Palm-Wine Will Flow}. As in \textit{Lake God}, the fight that persists between a corrupt leadership and the minority class abounds in \textit{And Palm-Wine Will Flow}. Set in the imaginary Fondom of Ewawa, Shey Ngong, the chief priest, engages in a spiritual battle with Fon (King) Chila Kintasi to persuade him to abdicate his position as Fon. Describing him as “the pig who knows only the hunger of its own stomach”\textsuperscript{24} and “the crocodile that swallows its own eggs”,\textsuperscript{25} Shey Ngong, in embittered terms, condemns the Fon’s method of rule in which he awards the red feather – the highest title in the land – to undeserving citizens like Kibanya, and with his entourage delights in the drinking of palm wine and eating of sumptuous food. In addition, he executes his critics in Ekpwang, referred to as the “bad bush”. Since his distribution of titles to non-meritorious individuals is a sham, especially as “[…] the Fon knows none other than his family and those that come to him with gifts in return for the red feather”\textsuperscript{26} Shey Ngong questions:

What is worth of a title if it must be bought? Those clamouring for the red feather are only making the Fon richer. Today, with a few goats and fowls

\textsuperscript{23} Butake, \textit{Lake God}…., p. 6.
\textsuperscript{24} Ibid., p. 91.
\textsuperscript{25} Ibid., p. 110.
\textsuperscript{26} Ibid., p. 91.
even the lowest of the low are beginning to file into the royal presence. How do you have a land in which everyone is a title-holder?\textsuperscript{27}

The Fon makes his rule worse by ruthlessly expropriating farmlands from the minority class. He re-distributes this land to his wives and the wives of Kibanya, Nformi Eleme, and Nformi Nyam, all his notables and cheerleaders. The expropriation of farmlands in \textit{And Palm-Wine Will Flow} implies that the main cultivators of land, who are women, are deeply implicated in the socio-political crises in the play. Affected by this conflict, the women take the centre stage to direct their society towards democracy and the fight for the government’s recognition of their strength. The chief priest, the gods and the ancestors remarkably support these women in their pursuit. The political leaderships of Chila Kintasi in \textit{And Palm-Wine Will Flow} and that of Joseph Kimbong in \textit{Lake God} are examples of unpopular regimes because of their corrupt nature; since individuals are not compensated for hard work rendered to the community, but because they have bribed their rulers with “a few goats and fowls.” In the plays, Butake portrays such communities as being on the verge of collapse.

\textbf{Women’s role within the post-colonial text}

The Fon’s mismanagement of the cattle-herdsmen/farmers’ conflict in \textit{Lake God} provokes a rebellion from the women. As members of the Fibuen cult, the women arrest Dewa, the Fulani nomad, bind and carry him to the Fon’s palace. Their action is meant to compel the Fon to seek a final solution to the interminable farmer-grazier conflict, a consequence of which is crop destruction in the community. What provokes the arrest is that when the women threaten Dewa with the “Kwifon”, an all-male regulatory cult in the land, Dewa spits in their faces and says, “[…] the Fon had […] the Kwifon”.\textsuperscript{28} Provoked by Dewa’s disdainful behaviour, the women come to a consensus by deciding, “[…] if Dewa says the Fon has […] the Kwifon, the Fibuen which has been asleep all these years must come to our rescue”.\textsuperscript{29} The Fon initiates a settlement when he orders that Dewa should compensate for the destroyed crops with the sum of 30€. Considering that 30€ as compensation for acres of destroyed corn is ridiculous, the women decide to release the Fibuen cult without mitigation. As a sign of their determination, the women, first of all, openly reject the sum of

\textsuperscript{27} Ibid., p. 97.
\textsuperscript{28} Ibid., p. 15.
\textsuperscript{29} Ibidem.
30€ and insist that “Dewa and his kind [should] leave this land”, since they “have borne the suffering long now”. They further emphasise that, “the cattle and their owners must go”.\textsuperscript{30} The women’s conflict exposes the Fon’s corrupt behaviour when he does not return the rejected sum of 30€ to Dewa. He keeps the money for himself, and further orders Dewa to augment the number of his cattle with two more cows from his herd. Dewa’s alarm at the Fon’s extortionist behaviour is portrayed in his outcry: “Kai, wusai Allah don go?” (Where has Allah gone to?).\textsuperscript{31}

Apparently frightened by the Fon’s unscrupulous manner of terrorising citizens, the men in Lake God have feared to confront the Fon with the grazier/farmers’ conflict. Moreover, the Kwifon which intervenes when such problems occur has been detained by the Fon, making the men more helpless. It is at this level that the Fibuen cult employs another measure to induce the Fon and the men to take up their political, social and cultural responsibilities. This measure entails the performance of a ritual known as the oath of sealed lips. Butake comments in the stage direction that introduces the scene to the women’s ritual that the oath is meant to “display a spirit of defiance that would shock their men folk”.\textsuperscript{32} No woman, according to the oath, is either supposed to go to bed with her husband or cook food for him until he has joined the other men to compel the Fon to send away the cattle graziers and their cattle. Secondly the Fon must pacify the god of the lake and also make his wife, the queen, to bear an heir to the throne to ensure continuity in the chieftaincy.

The oath of sealed lips is a cosmic ritual because it is performed on a moonlit night. Moonlight adds to the vitality of the ritual as it reverberates spiritual energy from the cosmos. An invocation of ancestral presence together with powers from the moon render all the incantations, the songs, the dances and objects employed in the ritual, invincible. An elderly cult member, Ma Kusham, leads the performance of the oath. The ritual comprises of “broom-sticks” which have been cooked in the most potent medicines and herbs in the land”.\textsuperscript{33} In addition, “the most important ingredient as far as [the] oath is concerned comes from the sacred pot of the lake god which Shey Bo-Nyo guards jealously”.\textsuperscript{34} The Fibuen cult members perform the gestures of holding the broomsticks “between the thumb and forefinger”. They proceed by making a vertical crossing of their lips with the sticks which they later break and throw away. Their action is accompanied by the following vow, “If my mouth discloses what my ears

\textsuperscript{30} Ibid., pp. 17–18.
\textsuperscript{31} Ibid., p. 18.
\textsuperscript{32} Ibid., p. 24.
\textsuperscript{33} Ibid., p. 25.
\textsuperscript{34} Ibidem.
have heard in this gathering, may my tongue swell and fill my mouth with
dumbness”.

After the women’s oath, one of the male characters in the play, Maimo, shares with his friends an alarming experience he has with his wife:

Two days ago, I asked Kimbong about food. All day long I had not eaten anything. She said there was no soup. The following morning I went to inspect my traps at Kingongoo. Luckily I found a small hare in one of them. So I went home happily looking forward to a good meal that evening. When the moment arrived, Chinfon brought a calabash of water and dish full of meat. I washed my hands quickly expecting the bowl of foo-foo to arrive any moment. Nothing came. I tasted the food for salt and pepper. It was a delicious sauce and I felt as if there were a thousand famished dogs in my stomach. I called out angrily for Chinfon and asked him where the foo-foo was. Do you know what I heard? Laughter! A lot of it. And my wife was laughing out loudest. I waited a little while and still there was no foo-foo. So I went over to find out what was going on. ‘Where is the foo-foo?’ I asked. Kimbong laughed again and said cattle had destroyed everything. Before I knew what I was doing, I had given her a sound slap in the face. The house went dead. […] But hunger betrayed me. My wife wiped the tears from her face, looked straight into mine and said in a cold voice that if I wanted to eat foo-foo, I should go to Ngangba and make the cattle leave the land instead of beating a defenceless woman who has been fighting all her life to feed her husband and the children. After that I could not even eat the delicious hare. I thought I could make up for our dispute last night, but I have already told you what her answer was.

The rest of the men who have had similar experiences with their wives decide to persuade the leaders of the Kwifon to confront the Fon with the problems in the land, otherwise their women will starve them to death. Despite their consensus to join the women’s course against the Fon, the men however question “who gave such power to the women?” Their worry puts in perspective the peripheral position that women occupy, not only in Lake God, but also in most patriarchal settings. The men’s worry confirms that the power embodied in the oath of sealed lips is endowed in spiritual power which impact has truly shocked the community, including the men.

The stage taken by the women offers a better platform on which major issues in the community are uncovered, discussed, although not totally resolved.

---

35 Ibid., p. 25.
36 Ibid., p. 30.
37 Ibidem.
Though the play’s end is tragic, the community is, however, convinced that women if determined enough, can change the status quo. Their determination is read in their outright rejection of the sum of 30€ that the Fon had asked Dewa to pay as compensation for destroyed crops and the oath of sealed lips which they have employed to initiate and foster dialogue between belligerent factions in the community. The women’s role creates an awareness that outlines certain precepts of feminine emancipation, since the men had secretly expressed fears that if they fail to confront the Fon about major issues, the women will take control over the land. Their rebellion, therefore, attempts to debunk the stereotypical image forced on them by both Western influence, symbolised by Christianity, and “patriarchal imperialism”.

The women in *And Palm-Wine Will Flow* as in *Lake God* stand out as symbols of liberation. Considering liberation as a process of freeing a suppressed group of people from an autocratic political rule, the women also employ this process as a strategy to secure respectable positions for themselves by fighting for equal rights. To achieve liberation, they have employed natural powers to establish order, thereby posing as catalysts for change.

The character that leads women into a rebellion in *And Palm-Wine Will Flow* is Kwengong. She doubles as Shey Ngong’s first wife and Earth-goddess. As Earth-goddess, she assists significantly to liberate Ewawa, especially as she collaborates spiritually with Shey Ngong – her husband – the chief priest. Their major objective is to challenge and eventually defeat Fon Chila Kintasi’s dictatorial rule. Under the full control of the spirit of Earth-goddess, Kwengong is the first ritual character to react to the invocations of the chief priest. The invocations are an appeal to the gods and ancestors to liberate the land from absolutism and drunkenness. Therefore the Earth-goddess’ first pronouncement on the future of the land is bleak, especially as Chila Kintasi has dishonoured the gods and the ancestors of the land, oppressed innocent citizens and worst of all dispossessed women of their land. The Earth-goddess’ first intervention, which is aimed at resolving these crises, is portrayed in the following judgement:

The sun shines on the hills
The sun shines in the valley
The sun shines in the depths of the streams
The sun shines.\(^{38}\)

In the above prophecy, she curses the land with a drought and eventually with an earthquake when Messenger (from the Fon’s palace) comes to the

---

sacred grove (where all the action takes place) with some information that Shey Ngong’s palm bushes and his wives’ farmlands have been seized for the benefit of the Fon’s notables, his watchdogs and their wives. It is worth adding that land seized from Shey Ngong’s wives represents the expropriation of farmlands from the poor majority and women in Ewawa. Being the voice of the gods and ancestors, her reaction to land seizure benefits the process of democracy and the fight for women’s rights. Re-appropriating land through the Earth-goddess guarantees livelihoods in Ewawa. Expropriation of farmlands in the entire community is embodied in the following complaints made by Shey Ngong’s wives:

Shey! Our husband!  
Father of our children!  
[...] Are you sitting there quietly  
When our farms have been seized from us?  
What shall we eat? What shall our children eat?  
What shall you eat? \(^{39}\)

Because of the Fon’s repressive rule, the Earth-goddess prophesises that his rule will be short lived, despite the mistaken belief that, “[the] Fon never dies! The Fon reigns eternally!” \(^{40}\) This belief holds true for some local regimes, in which politicians often cling to power for decades, as freedom of expression is suppressed. Contrary to such regimes, the Earth-goddess forecasts the downfall of Chila Kintasi by affirming that, “the sun that rises must always set!” \(^{41}\) As soon as the Chief priest judges the Earth-goddess’ curse on the land to be severe, he commissions the women of Ewawa, led by the Earth-goddess, to terminate the rule of the Fon in a bid to spare the entire Fondom of Ewawa from a drought and an earthquake. But the Earth-goddess’ pronouncements abound with determination, especially as she maintains in her prophecies that “[the] curse remains! The plague remains!” \(^{42}\) Most of her prophesies are punctuated with “must”, indicating that the Fon will be compelled by a necessity of physical and spiritual force to renounce the throne. The use of “must” by the Earth-goddess parallels a similar usage in \textit{Lake God}. Each time the Fibuen cult members pronounce “must” in their speech, as with the women in the farmer/cattle-grazer conflict in \textit{Lake God}, a serious action immediately follows. These

\(^{39}\) Ibid., p. 96.  
\(^{40}\) Ibid., p. 100.  
\(^{41}\) Ibidem.  
\(^{42}\) Ibid., p. 101.
speech-act-events also hold true for the Earth-goddess when she foresees that further compromises must not be made with Chila Kintasi’s regime.

Kwengong engages a strategy to totally liberate the land. Together with members of the women’s cult, she embarks on a spiritual mission to overthrow Chila Kintasi. Shey Ngong, the chief priest, dispatches them on this mission after performing a series of incantations and invocations. Kibaranko initially assists the women in this mission. Kibaranko is a masquerade, previously dispatched by the chief priest to destroy the Fon. He succeeds in ransacking the palace, but fails to eliminate the Fon. It is the latter task that the women set out to accomplish. As it is common with cult practices, the women meet at a ritual site known as the “twin-streams”, to perform certain rites, before confronting the Fon. The rites constitute oath takings, invocations and the preparation of certain medicinal concoctions. The latter would subsequently be employed as an ultimate weapon to destroy the Fon, his family, and his entire government. Although Butake does not provide specific details on how this ritual is performed at the twin-streams, he however mentions in Kwengong’s flashback that all the women, mostly the elderly ones, were naked. Exposed female bodies are generally considered a taboo in some African communities. It is believed that female nudity is strong and incorporates supernatural powers that are dangerous. Showing, particularly post-menopausal female nakedness during social, cultural and political unrest, as in the post-election violence in Bamenda in 1992, is considered an abomination. Not only are the women naked at the twin-streams, but they also produce a special concoction from the “savoury juice from [their] vaginas”. The women, later assign Kwengong as Earth-goddess to carry the pot of concoction to the palace. Upon her arrival at the palace, she calls out to the Fon – also an epitome of patriarchy – to receive a final message from the women of Ewawa:

Chila Kintasi! Chila Kintasi!
Come out and receive the wares
The women over whom you wield
Great power have sent you!
Come out, I say, and receive the goods
Sent by those you dishonour so!

The Fon’s attempt at resisting the Earth-goddess is unsuccessful, especially as her mission is controlled by an insurmountable, supernatural force. The

---

43 Ibid., p. 109.
44 Ibid., p. 110.
Earth-goddess’ determination to free the land and to accomplish her mission of securing human rights for marginalised groups in Ewawa is portrayed when she insists that the Fon must drink the “savoury juice from the women’s vaginas that will make his belly swell with fat”.46 The Fon’s preference for death, rather than to drink the potion forced on him accelerates the Earth-goddess’ final decision:

Then you will die indeed, Chila Kintasi.
Your mouth has pronounced judgement.
Die and deliver the land from the
Abominations of drunkenness and gluttony!
(The Fon begins to reel until he collapses)
Die Chila Kintasi, die!
Die Fon! So that we may think! The people need your death to think!
(Fon lies still [...]).47

After accomplishing her mission, the Earth-goddess delivers the proceeding message to the rest of the jubilant women and the chief priest; “The sun of the land has set! The elephant has fallen! The lion of Ewawa is no more!”48 The women’s successful destruction of an icon of oppression suggests that they can also take political decisions to change society. With Chila Kintasi eliminated, it is the women who introduce democracy in the land. They clearly object to the rule of Fons (symbols of corruption) and insist that a council of elders (rule of law) must henceforth rule Ewawa. Such a council will be elected in the market place by the entire community. Accordingly, in a process of reconstructing women’s lost identity, the Earth-goddess, together with the women in the play, offers a different perspective to the socio-political voice of women in the community.

This voice is embedded in the rituals of resistance performed, being a revolutionary media to assert their identity. The change that the women effectuate in And Palm-Wine Will Flow, like in Lake God is therefore evaluated from these rituals.

These rituals do not only reflect the Cameroonian context of the play, but also serve as tools to achieve justice and peace in the community. In effect, the women’s role offers a significant contribution to the political revolution in the play, especially as the social and the political instability in And Palm-Wine Will Flow, which parallels that in Lake God, exposes autocratic rulers who do not encourage democracy, good governance, and civil rights in their
communities. The rebellion mounted by women in both plays clearly challenges typical patriarchal rulership and its teachings. It is evident that women’s voices could be heard only when they employ strange, but also efficient strategies to make patriarchal institutions listen to them. The voice that these women, the subaltern,49 finally employs with spiritual support from Shey Bo-Nyo (Lake God) and Shey Ngong (And Palm-Wine Will Flow), seems to suggest that cultural symbols could be a commendable method to change the politics of a society.

Conclusion

If post-colonial Cameroonian women are considered to have been colonised by their men folk with what Ama Ata Aidoo describes as “their new power”50 then women in Lake God and And Palm-Wine Will Flow, have adopted the oath of sealed lips and the rites at the twin-streams, as their new language, to confront androcentric cultures. The women in both plays represent a majority of suppressed contemporary Cameroonian women. The impact of the rituals performed suggests that men, who generally dominate social, cultural, and political institutions, can be helpless when serious challenges emerge in society. It may be relevant to say that Butake’s rural settings, together with their traditional rulers, could be metaphorical simulations of contemporary and higher political states. These political states could either be Cameroon, from where Butake hails, or other nations with a) a repressive political rule and b) male-dominated structures in which women’s rights are abused and freedom of expression subdued.


Human Trafficking and International Migration: Empirical Evidence from the Nigerian “Harlots’ Society” in Colonial Ghana

Abstract

Illicit migration, human trafficking and the commercial sex trade have become some of the most socio-economic, politically volatile and pressing issues in the contemporary world. This study examines these three interconnected issues from a historical perspective as well as analyzing how they relate to Nigerians on the Gold Coast (colonial Ghana). This study acknowledges that leading international migration studies seem to have focused on labour migration, immigrant remittances and related issues, but have ignored the intellectually stimulating case of a thriving Nigerian-dominated sex industry on the Gold Coast.

Introduction

The economic crises triggered by the Great Depression of the 1930s and 1940s were partly responsible for the mass emigration of Nigerians to the Gold Coast and other locations in Africa. The Gold Coast was important for its agricultural, mining and extractive industries and offered some socio-economic pull factors to migrant workers across West Africa during the colonial period. In the first instance, the presence of these migrant workers encouraged and attracted sex workers, some of whom provided auxiliary services such as temporary accommodation, avenues for pleasure, including the sex industry and catering, which migrant workers needed to facilitate their integration into their new environment. Their case was peculiar because many of them migrated without their wives, while others were simply unmarried. Accordingly, the Nigerian sex industry in the Gold Coast grew out of the necessity to meet these variegated needs and demands.

To address the salient issues in this study, the work examines the growth of the Nigerian commercial sex industry on the Gold Coast, the beginning of the mass departure of Nigerians to the area, how the migration of some Nigerians was linked with an organized human trafficking network, and the impact of the Nigerian organized sex industry. Finally, the article highlights the responses of

* PhD, Department of History and Strategic Studies, University of Lagos, Nigeria, e-mail: omonosiki@gmail.com.
both the Nigerian and Gold Coast authorities to combat human trafficking and
the commercial sex trade.

A review of relevant literature

The issues of illicit migration, human trafficking and commercial sex activities within the West African sub-region have received avid coverage from intellectuals and scholars of migration studies. While cautious scholars have pointed out the changing nature of migration in West Africa, others have looked at the issue from the perspective of the socio-economic implications of migration in the sub-region.¹ For instance, Emmanuel Akyeampong perceives the commercial sex industry as “the commoditization of casual sex” motivated by acquisition and related socio-cultural considerations.²

Outside of West Africa, the commercial sex industry has received considerable attention in the literature of social history. V. Bullough and B. Bullough in their studies of commercial sex activities have highlighted the origins of and stimuli for commercial sex activities in some major societies and civilisations.³ Investigating the causes of the phenomenon, Sukanya Harintrakal believes that an imbalance in male-female relations, whereby women are “socialized into serving” the interest of men, is a major cause of women’s involvement in the commercial sex industry.⁴ As plausible as this conclusion may be, the factors of poverty, self-indulgence and acquisition in addition to peer group pressure cannot be completely ruled out.

On their part, feminists believe that the commercial sex industry is “morally undesirable” no matter what economic advantages may be accrued from it, because it is one of the most graphic examples of male domination over women.⁵ However, this position by the feminists must be considered along with

the context of gender structures, international market mechanisms, and a global class system in which women have found themselves. Finally, the data on illicit migration, human trafficking and commercial sex activities indicate that socio-economic and political push and pull factors are important in any discussion of the connection between and among the three human elements.

The emigration of Nigerians to the Gold Coast: push and pull factors

The migration of Nigerians to the Gold Coast was part of the general migration of labour across the West African sub-region during the pre-colonial and colonial eras. The trend was due to socio-economic and historical exigencies. Nkamleu’s study of the trend demonstrates that pre-colonial Africa was a “mobile continent” where migrations were oriented towards trade, labour and religion (in the form of pilgrimages), without many legal restraints and barriers. Factors such as natural disasters, shifting cultivation practices, socio-political issues, internecine warfare, and slavery were important factors in the movement of people from one place to another in the sub-region. Accordingly, migrants regarded the sub-region as an economic unit within which trade in goods and services could flow at all times.

In the same vein, the colonial period witnessed an increase in migration activities in West Africa. Improvements in transportation and other communication facilities such as harbour development, and railway and road construction served as a catalyst that facilitated the free movement of people, ideas and goods across the sub-region. For instance, the completion of the Thies-Kayes line in 1923 to link the hinterland of West Africa to the coast, especially at Dakar, as well as the construction of the Accra-Kumasi and Accra-Sekondi lines between 1923 and 1927, increased migration patterns in West Africa. A similar impact was

---


8 Ibid., p. 4.

9 Ibid., pp. 4–5.


11 Ibid., pp. 1–3.

made with the construction of the Port Harcourt-Enugu-Jos line, linking the northern and eastern parts of Nigeria between 1922 and 1926 as well as the line from Dakar to Saint Louis, between Dakar and Bamako and the Dakar-Niger line in 1923. In this regard, colonial transport facilities served as “a tamer of distance.” Consequently, between 1924 and 1932, there was an increasing migration of Nigerians and other West Africans for work in the plantations of the Ivory Coast and the Gold Coast as well as the migration of other West Africans to Nigeria. From this connection, the Gold Coast and a few other centres in Africa were important overseas destinations for Nigerians. This continued up to the late 1930s, and early 1950s when global socio-economic and political factors such as the Great Depression and the Second World War affected human migration in West Africa.

The development of the Nigerian “Area Harlots Society” on the Gold Coast

The “Area Harlots Society” was a Nigerian commercial sex business platform on the Gold Coast. It was connected with human trafficking and the commercial sex industry where Nigerian women played a prominent role. The beginnings of the human trafficking trade and commercial sex industry are well documented in archival sources. Available evidence points to the inter-war period, in particular between 1919 and 1935 and the gradual progression of the human trafficking business in Nigeria. For instance, an ordinary woman named Ewere Orara and two of her relatives were reported to be involved in an organized human trafficking business from Nigeria to the Gold Coast. Strangely enough, they were reported to have “disappeared on the Gold Coast many years ago, probably about 1920, and there is a suggestion that both of them were sold (into the sex trade)”.

14 Ibid., p. 151.
15 Ibid., pp. 8–10.
18 CSO: 36005/83, No. 1763/21, from the Secretary’s Office, Western Provinces, Ibadan.
In addition, following a survey conducted by the Chief Inspector of Labour and the Commissioner of Police on the Gold Coast, the human trafficking trade was traced to the period during the First World War.\textsuperscript{19} This was when the Gold Coast Regiment returned from a campaign in Cameroon along with some women from Calabar and other parts of the Eastern Provinces, such as Ediba, Afikpo, Ezumutu, Abriba, Afuna Town, Ikom, Ugep and Obubra in the now defunct Ojoga Province of Nigeria.\textsuperscript{20} Whilst on the Gold Coast, these women were believed to have organized themselves into a commercial sex cartel.

The report also stated that it was certain that there were large numbers of commercial sex workers wherever there were aggregations of labourers. The data indicates that as in the case of the labourers themselves, the women left their country with the idea of making money and returning home with their savings and a large quantity of fine clothes.\textsuperscript{21} True to the findings, a Nigerian commercial sex worker confessed to the Labour Minister that many of them were enticed out of Nigeria because of material gains and other pecuniary considerations. She said: “If I get plenty of money and buy plenty of fine things, my sisters in my country will also follow me to do the same job. Here we get a lot more money than in Calabar”.\textsuperscript{22}

The situation of Calabar in the evolution of the commercial sex trade in West Africa during the colonial period, as well as the connection between human trafficking and international migration is well documented.\textsuperscript{23} For instance, by the 1930s the town of Opobo on the coastal area close to Calabar served as a recruitment centre for commercial sex workers who were trafficked to major cities along the Atlantic coast of Africa (especially the Gulf of Guinea). In addition, it is reported that more than 50 women in the area lived on and practised the commercial sex trade in the 1930s.\textsuperscript{24} By the 1940s, many commercial sex workers migrated from the area to the Gold Coast.

In the same vein, the Obubra area of Cross River Basin was reported to be notorious for supplying commercial sex workers to major cities in West Africa. Their involvement in the business has been traced to their exposure to European activities in West Africa. For instance, between 1888 and 1909, the local

\textsuperscript{19} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{20} CSO: 36005/4, from the Labour Department, Kumasi, Ashanti, to the Colonial Secretary, Victoriaborg, Accra, 8 May 1940, NAI.
\textsuperscript{21} CSO: 36005/25–26, from the Labour Department, Kumasi, Ashanti, to the Colonial Secretary, Victoriaborg, Accra, 8 May 1940, NAI.
\textsuperscript{22} CSO: 36005/26, from the Labour Department, Kumasi, Ashanti, to the Colonial Secretary, Victoriaborg, Accra, 8 May 1940, NAI.
\textsuperscript{23} Naanen, ‘Itinerant Gold Mines...”, pp. 57–79.
communities were exposed to an influx of foreigners and their activities, such as European traders, explorers and soldiers. Some of them were employed as concubines or mistresses. Furthermore, from the beginning of 1920, such women from the area were to be found in colonial cities such as Port Harcourt, Calabar, Lagos, the coastal cities of Cameroon, Fernando Po (Equatorial Guinea), and in the Gold Coast cities of Accra, Kumasi, and Sekondi, among others. More specifically, available evidence indicates that there were more than 500 Obubra commercial sex workers on the Gold Coast in the 1940s.

By the early 1940s, migration from the area for the commercial sex trade had become a lucrative venture similar to what is believed to be currently going on in the Benin City area of Nigeria, where it is argued that several households have at least one female travelling to Italy or other European countries for commercial sex activities. Moreover, a colonial report of 29 July 1941 affirmed that the migration of women from Nigeria to the Gold Coast for commercial sex activities was a profitable and well-organised trade, supported and maintained by the very communities to which the women themselves belonged. According to the report, in certain areas of the Obubra Division of Ogoja Province for example, there was hardly a family that did not have an interest in the trade. It also disclosed that the elderly in those communities openly admitted that they received a fee, amounting to some British (West African) pounds, from every woman who practised commercial sex within or outside the province. The report also revealed that the affected communities had organized societies, which were responsible for the management of the trade.

Moreover, a Gold Coast source estimated that in 1933 alone, nearly 400 of the Calabar girls had left Nigeria for the Gold Coast to carry on the trade of prostitution. Interestingly, women from the zone were all described as “Calabar girls.” On the Gold Coast, among the local communities, they were known as the “Akuna Kuna girls.” The women earned close to £200 from the Gold Coast every month, and repatriated most of this money to their relatives in

26 CSO21/14/File No. 03028/s.864/3, from the Chief Secretary’s Office, Lagos, Nigeria, to the Honourable Colonial Secretary, Gold Coast, 1 February 1936, NAI; CSO 892/31/s.4: Gold Coast Police, Accra, ‘Statement of Mrs. Nuada Minadrichiawan’, 29 June 1933, PRAAD; Coquery-Vidrovitch, African Women, pp. 125–27.
28 CSO: 36005/107, from the Governor of the Colony, Lagos, to the Governor, Gold Coast, Accra, 29 July 1941, NAI.
29 Ibidem.
30 CSO: 36005/27, from the Labour Department, Kumasi, Ashanti, to the Colonial Secretary, Victoriaborg, Accra, 8 May 1940, NAI.
Nigeria. In 1940, the Nigerian Youth Movement (NYM) compiled a list of the names and addresses of the ‘pimps’ who exploited the sexuality of women, and it was submitted to the colonial authorities in Lagos and the Gold Coast police. The police then provided an escort to Mr. Prince Eikineh, the president of the Gold Coast branch of the NYM, in order to conduct a census and the results revealed that more than 206 Nigerian women were involved in the sex industry in Sekondi and Takoradi alone. Another census was conducted in other areas of the Gold Coast. The outcome is indicated in the table below:

### Numbers of Nigerian prostitutes on the Gold Coast in 1940

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S/No</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>a) Accra</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>b) Eastern Province</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>c) Western Province</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>d) Central Province</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td></td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td></td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td></td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>e) Ashanti</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td></td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td></td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td></td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>1206</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Report by the NYM and the Gold Coast Police in 1940

---

31 Ibidem.
32 CSO36005/29–31, from Prince Eikineh, President, NYM, to the Gold Coast Police, Accra, “Statement of Charges”, 23 November 1939, NAI.
33 CSO: 36005/34, from Prince Eikineh, President, NYM.
34 Ibidem.
The table above indicates the demographic distribution of Nigerian women involved in commercial sex activities on the Gold Coast.

Eventually, the activities of the commercial sex workers and human traffickers became a source of embarrassment to the authorities in Nigeria and on the Gold Coast. Whilst responding to an independent inquiry made by the colonial government in Nigeria, on the subject of human trafficking and the commercial sex trade, the Gold Coast authorities expressed displeasure over the issue. The authorities admitted that it required strong and elaborate methods to stop the commercial sex business.

Accordingly, the Gold Coast colonial authorities proposed some practical measures to arrest the trend. First, they suggested that if the Government of Nigeria decided to put into effect its proposed system of exit permits for women, the Gold Coast Government would be prepared, subject to obtaining the approval of the Secretary of State (in London), to introduce legislation prohibiting the entry into the Gold Coast of any Nigerian woman not in possession of a Nigerian exit permit. However, they added a proviso that “it would be impracticable to make ‘good reasons’ alone a condition of entry for a Nigerian woman, because Immigration Officers would not in most cases be in a position to judge the accuracy or validity of the reason adduced.”

Secondly, they expressed the willingness of the colonial government to take action under section 12 (2) of the Immigration Restriction Ordinance (Cap.42) to deport and repatriate, at the expense of the Government of Nigeria, any Nigerian woman found (within 18 months of her entry into the Gold Coast) to be involved in commercial sex activities. Thirdly, in order to enable “other persons connected with the profession” to be deported, the Gold Coast Government expressed its readiness to amend the Immigration Restriction Ordinance. Fourthly, they advised their Nigerian counterparts to extend the permit system restrictions to males, if they considered that men connected with human trafficking and commercial sex activities should be repatriated as well.

On the part of the Nigerian government, certain measures were deemed necessary to arrest the trend. As a result, the various district officers in the Eastern Provinces, who superintended over most of the communities from where many of these Nigerian women migrated to the Gold Coast for the sex industry, agreed that the human trafficking and commercial sex trades had been set up and operated as an organized cartel, referred to in the local parlance as “Clan Clubs” or the “Area Harlots Society”, under the control of many influential dignitaries.

35 CSO: 36005/123, “Traffic in Women to the Gold Coast”.
36 Ibidem.
37 CSO: 36005/89, File No. OB. 503/2, from District Officer, Obubra Division, to the Resident, Ogoja Province, Ogoja, “Cross River Harlots”, 7 February 1941, NAI.
More specifically, the District Officer of the Obubra Division of the Ogoja Province reported that the pimps involved in the trafficking of women to the Gold Coast normally took a fee from the young women concerned, or in other words, they “arranged for their future payment, registered their names, and give them all the necessary information as to where they should practise etc.”\textsuperscript{38}

However, it should be noted that the issues of adventure and ignorance on the part of those who were trafficked played a significant part in the sustenance of the sex trade. Nevertheless, the imagery inherent in the whole process was one of acquisition and exploitation.

**Curbing the sex business in the Gold Coast: responses from Nigerian associations**

The conditions created by the commercial sex trade and illicit migration from Nigeria, provoked variegated responses although there was consensus on the need to arrest the trend. Indeed, official and non-official responses trailed the establishment of Nigerian prostitution ‘clubs’ on the Gold Coast. Governmental responses came mainly through diplomatic and administrative interactions. In contrast, non-official responses came through community enlightenment programmes, pressure group lobbying and media advocacy.

During the early 1940s, the *Nigerian Eastern Mail* quoted the response of the Sekondi branch of the Ibibio Union, a group of Nigerian migrant workers on the Gold Coast, as having complained of “this ruining of future women of their race”.\textsuperscript{39} Whilst commending the union for its radical and imaginative stance against commercial sex activities and the trafficking business, the magazine urged other ethnic unions and the Nigerian political organizations concerned about the “future of Nigerian womanhood to agitate, so as to bring to book the procurresses and pimps who are making a fat living out of human flesh and blood”.\textsuperscript{40} However, a critical look at the responses shows a trend that was diverse, tentative, and sometimes more complex than simplified characterizations can reveal.

To be specific, the Ibibio Union was particularly active in its struggle to check the activities of Ibibio commercial sex workers because it was rumoured that members were collaborators and collected a thirty-shilling tax from sex

\textsuperscript{38} Ibidem.

\textsuperscript{39} The Nigerian Eastern Mail is cited in *West Africa*, a sub-regional journal, 13 September 1941, p. 887.

\textsuperscript{40} Ibidem.
workers.\textsuperscript{41} In addition, they were accused of extending support and approval for the business.\textsuperscript{42}

However, between 1939 and the 1940s, the union tried to raise awareness on the adverse effects of human trafficking and commercial sex activities especially as they concerned their members. Consequently, communication was made between the Ibibio Union on the Gold Coast and the branch in Lagos, as well as the home community with the intention to end the human trafficking business.\textsuperscript{43} However, beyond awareness creation and sensitization, there is no clear evidence of any major achievements by the union as irregular migration and human trafficking from the clan continued up until the 1950s.\textsuperscript{44}

A further insight can be drawn from the activities and responses of another Nigerian community union. Like the Ibibio Union, the Nta Cross River Union was desirous of ending the human trafficking business. In a petition to the Chief Secretary of the Governor of Nigeria, the union seriously condemned the practice.\textsuperscript{45}

The union also made other discoveries. Firstly, it reported that because of the “mass exodus” of women, the whole clan was highly depopulated. It also argued that economically, if the exodus was allowed to continue, there would be a depopulation which posterity would be unable to remedy because the community would face extinction. Secondly, it suggested that the women who migrated to the Gold Coast “have been the cause of death of their kith and kin due to jealousy and an inordinate desire for ascendency”\textsuperscript{46}. Thirdly, it also complained that the mass exodus of the women effectively reduced the male population and eventually the number of tax-payers. On the surface, these claims were rather spurious, but the message was that mass emigration had an adverse effect on the demography of the area with noticeable consequences for socio-economic activities.

Fourthly, the union asserted that the women were known to render themselves sterile to carry out their sexual activities. Available records indicate that this was true to some extent, but it would be fanciful to assume that the local knowledge of medicine in the area at the time was potent enough to make the impact claimed by the union. Nevertheless, the cultural practices, it is argued, stemmed from

\textsuperscript{41} CSO: 36005/4, Extracted from Ogoja Province, Annual Report 1938, Part II – Native Administration Affairs, NAI.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{43} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{44} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{45} CSO: 36005/390, Ref. NCRU/L/3, from Nta Cross River Union, Lagos, to the Honourable Chief Secretary to the Governor, Lagos, “Emigration of Nta Clan Women to Gold Coast”, 17 September 1953, NAI.
\textsuperscript{46} CSO: 36005/390, Ref. NCRU/L/3, from Nta Cross River Union, Lagos.
the women’s belief that they were potent enough to render them sterile whilst at
the same time protecting them against venereal diseases.

Moreover, the union also claimed that the few remaining men at home were
unable to help in community work because of their venereal decreases. In fact,
sexually transmitted diseases were a major cause of worry among colonial
administrators during the interwar years. Just as migrants moved across the
sub-region, the diseases also spread from one location to another.\(^{47}\)

Lastly, in light of the above, the union directed their leaders to inform the
colonial authorities to ensure that no woman from the Nta Clan was given
a passport to the Gold Coast either for a casual visit or for other purposes,
unless she had a letter of authority from the union.\(^{48}\) Earlier, in 1935, when the
Secretary of the Eastern Provinces visited the area, the clan raised the issue of
the commercial sex industry. When a report on the subject was subsequently
compiled, it was discovered that 12 per cent of the Nta female population
was involved in commercial sex activities. Similar findings were made in the
neighbouring communities of Uhumunu (Bahumunu), where approximately 15
per cent of the females had emigrated, while the Nnam community had more
than one-third of its adult females involved in commercial sex activities spread
across Nigeria and the Gold Coast.\(^ {49}\)

Though some of the points made by the union were rather exaggerated,
members were ostensibly driven by the need to express what they held dearly
about their culture. To them, the attribution of promiscuity to their community
was inaccurate. Outsider observers, paying little attention to their cultural
background and the dynamics of social relations in the area could be quick to
ascribe the behaviour of a few commercial sex workers to an entire ethnic group.
The exact truth of this matter, however, was difficult to determine. Certainly,
the union struggled to change the wrong perception.

However, the petition by the Nta Union did not receive any positive
response from the relevant authorities albeit with numerous excuses while their
suggestions could not be carried through.

Though it is difficult to understand what the police stood to lose if they
implemented such a suggestion, it was obvious that the Gold Coast authorities
refused to be swayed by sentimental arguments on purely professional matters.
Hence, they chose the path of caution, which in part could be conceived as lack
of concern.

In contrast, the colonial authorities in Nigeria acknowledged the genuineness
of the agitations of the Nta people. The next response of the police reflected

\(^{47}\) Coquery-Vidrovitch, *African Women*...
\(^{48}\) Ibidem.
the general thinking in the security quarters, in that it would be very difficult to rely on travel permits to restrict the movement of the women between Nigeria and the Gold Coast. According to security experts, the women could easily get an affidavit indicating that they were going to visit their aunt or other relatives on the Gold Coast. Hence, they proposed that the proper approach should be for the Gold Coast authorities to identify the guilty ones among the women and expel them.\(^{50}\)

The broader significance of the acknowledgment of the efforts of the Nta Union was that other ethnic associations were encouraged to lobby for official measures to arrest the trend. It also provided the catalyst in rallying and mobilizing communities and ethnic associations to support the humanitarian efforts to end the human trafficking business.

Moreover, the efforts of the Nta Union received acknowledgement at the provincial level. As early as March 1939, the Secretary to the Eastern Provinces had mandated the Resident of the Obubra Division to thoroughly investigate the issue of the emigration of women from the division to the Gold Coast.\(^{51}\) The directive of the Chief Secretary to the government of Nigeria was a prelude to the action of the secretary. The Chief Secretary had directed investigations on the root cause of human trafficking from the Obubra Division to the Gold Coast in line with the petitions of some Nigerian socio-cultural and political associations on the Gold Coast.

Moreover, a few other ethnic associations resented the commoditization of their women from the perspective of cultural preservation. Earlier in 1937, the Akunakuna Union, in the Southern Provinces presented a similar petition to the Chief Commissioner of the Southern Provinces. As in the case of the reply given to the Nta Union, the colonial authorities attacked the Akunakuna Union instead of the issue brought before them. For instance, rather than addressing the substantive issue, the colonial authorities maintained that “the women would not leave home if the men made life tolerable for them, and did not insist on their doing all the heavy manual labour, here euphemistically described as ‘help in the community work’. Up the Cross River…women even have to climb the palm trees.”\(^{52}\) In a society governed by traditional modes of production, it was not impossible for women to participate in agricultural activities. However, it is arguable to conclude that this was the reason for human trafficking and commercial sex activities in the area. Hence, it is safer to say that the culture

\(^{50}\) CSO: 36005/396, from the Criminal Investigation Department.

\(^{51}\) CSO: 36005/7, from the Secretary’s Office, Eastern Provinces, Enugu, to the Honourable Chief Secretary to the Government, Lagos, “Traffic in Girls to the Gold Coast”, 2 October 1939, NAI.

\(^{52}\) CSO: 36005/392, A.M. Muir, Principal Assistant Secretary, Political.
of poverty and deprivation (which may act as a “trigger”), rather than gender relations in agricultural production, were some of the factors that fostered the psychology of dependency and the quest by the women to seek an easy way out of life outside of their communities.

There were also attempts by the Gold Coast Akajuk Union of Ogoja, to fight human trafficking and commercial sex activities involving their women. In a petition to the Nigerian Police, this socio-cultural association urged the relevant security agents to investigate and stem the tide of human trafficking from Ogoja to the Gold Coast.\textsuperscript{53}

The Owerri Division Union also presented interesting popular responses. In a letter to the Commissioner of the Colony in Lagos, the union proposed that passports should be granted only to those females who could show that they were traveling to the Gold Coast for legitimate reasons. The union compared its proposal with developments in England at the time, whereby ladies under the age of 21 were refused passports until the authorities were satisfied they were not involved in commercial sex activities. The commissioner commended the proposal and called for its adoption to stem the tide of human trafficking from Nigeria to the Gold Coast.\textsuperscript{54}

Moreover, the union made other discoveries. Firstly, in a letter dated 8 July 1941, the Lagos branch of the Owerri Division Union revealed that there was a growing habit of some women from the Owerri Province to leave behind both their husbands and children and make their way to various parts of Nigeria and even to the Gold Coast for the express purpose of indulging in the “illicit bodily traffic.” This act was considered very disgraceful as it tended to lower the standards of morality inherited from their progenitors. Secondly, the union reported that young girls were often taken to the Gold Coast where they were exploited. Thirdly, it also reported that some of their women were taken to the Gold Coast where they were “commoditized” to make money for their “madams.” Fourthly, the union bemoaned the Gold Coast press for apparently failing to spotlight on or call attention to the trafficking in women and its attendant effects, especially with regard to the spread of venereal diseases, which acted as “canker-worms eating up the fabric of our manhood.”\textsuperscript{55} However, the colonial authorities rejected the suggestion made by the association that, “passports of all descriptions” should no longer be issued to women and young females from the

\textsuperscript{53} CSO: 36005/396, the Criminal Investigation Department, the Nigeria Police, Lagos.
\textsuperscript{54} CSO: 36005/ 102, No. 2386/12, from the Commissioner of the Colony, Lagos, to the Honourable Chief Secretary to the Government, Lagos, “Traffic in Girls to the Gold Coast”, 16 July 1941, NAI.
\textsuperscript{55} CSO: 36005/103, from the Owerri Division Union, to the Commissioner of the Colony, Lagos, 8 July 1941.
community travelling to the Gold Coast unless accompanied by their husbands or by their parents.\textsuperscript{56}

In a similar development, the Owerri Division Union stressed that the colonial authorities should assist them in their determination to stop illegal emigration to the Gold Coast. The union remarked that:

It is a regrettable fact to note that this question should come up now that we are fighting against Hitlerism and Fascism-the enemies of peace and liberty; but since much harm is now being done to our manpower, through the unrestricted indulgence in these immoral practices as was evidenced by the result of the medical test on those about to take up active service on the Gold Coast in order to swell our forces in East Africa, we feel that the matter is one that requires urgent attention.\textsuperscript{57}

In the same vein, the Gold Coast branch of the Nigerian Youth Movement (NYM) was active in the enlightenment and awareness programme.\textsuperscript{58} In the final analysis, it should be stressed that these various ethnic organizations and associations sprang up to give organizational expressions and condemnations to what they considered an anomaly in their cultures. By their lobbying, they assisted in prompting the reluctant but sympathetic colonial officials to recognise the need to apply the necessary immigration laws and enlightenment programmes in order to check irregular migrations and commercial sex activities between Nigeria and the Gold Coast.\textsuperscript{59} Whilst resisting inhospitable indigenous groups who treated immigrants as unwelcome intruders, branches of such associations also acted as a watchdog on their members whose activities were inimical to the image of their communities.\textsuperscript{60}

There seems to have been similar sentiments in the media. For instance, the \textit{West Africa} magazine in some of its publications in the 1940s acted as a whistleblower. Specifically, in the March 15, 1941 edition of the magazine, an article written by one Henry Ormstorn, titled “The Social Question’, a Startling Disclosure,” indicated that:

Rumours of alleged mysterious features of a traffic in women and children between Nigeria and the Gold Coast led Mr. Floyer to investigate, one result being that a list was made of 80 names of young girls from the Owerri Province, recently found on the Gold Coast practising the trade of prostitute (sic)….It seems improbable that one area alone in Nigeria is affected. If it is, the Government

\textsuperscript{56} CSO: 36005/103, from the Owerri Division Union.
\textsuperscript{57} Ibidem.
\textsuperscript{58} CSO: 36005/33, from Prince Eikineh, President, NYM, to the Gold Coast Police.
\textsuperscript{60} Coleman, \textit{Nigeria: Background} ..., pp. 212–213.
of Nigeria, if necessary with help from Great Britain, will no doubt see-and is surely already seeing—whether war time economic restrictions to a preventable extent can explain such horrible expedients.”

The paper also described the exodus of young Nigerians to the Gold Coast as a “tragic band” and raised some questions on the matter. Media reports such as the aforementioned encouraged the colonial authorities in Nigeria and the Gold Coast to do the necessary things. An exclusive foray into the archive reveals that the colonial authorities were pushed to consider the legislations as well as welfare packages to checkmate human trafficking and commercial sex activities between Nigeria and the Gold Coast. Firstly, the Nigerian side agreed that the long-term remedy for human trafficking and commercial sex activities was to make the lives of the ordinary women more attractive than the life of a sex worker, maintaining that this could be done through years of social improvement. Secondly, they recommended that the authorities of the Gold Coast should put in place measures that would prohibit the entry of “native immigrants” if they were undesirable or had no reputable objective for visiting the Gold Coast. Thirdly, they also recommended that the Gold Coast Government could invoke and apply the power to repatriate commercial sex workers at the expense of those harbouring them. Fourthly, they pointed out that steps could be taken to control the departure of women to the Gold Coast, as a part of wartime measures, under section 41A of Part CCC of Regulations No. 25 of 1940 of the Defence Regulations, which immigration officers could not implement prior to the outbreak of the Second World War.

It is obvious that by fully incorporating the colonial authorities into the fight to combat illicit migration, human trafficking and commercial sex activities, the media succeeded in drawing public attention to the adverse effects of the triple issues. Nevertheless, they also provoked fierce official reactions from some colonial officials. For instance, because of the embarrassment caused in the media, Mr. R. S. Mallinson, the District Officer of Obubra Division, whose domain was adversely affected by the triple phenomena, in a correspondence to the Resident (Officer) of Ogoja remarked that:

---

61 CSO: 36005/92, Henry Ormstorn, the *West Africa* Magazine, “The Social Question, a Startling Disclosure”, 1941, NAI.
62 CSO: 36005/86, No. 303/132, from the Secretary’s Office, Eastern Provinces, Enugu, to the Honourable Chief Secretary to the Government, Lagos, “Traffic in Girls to the Gold Coast”, 29 May 1941, NAI.
63 CSO: 36005/86, No. 303/132, from the Secretary’s Office, Eastern Provinces.
The intention of adding something to the considerable amount which has already been written about the habits of the women of this area, and the recently circulated list of the names of Nigerian women now “practicing” on the Gold Coast, of which five hundred or more came from this Division, brings the matter to a head. It was apparently the intention of the circular referred to, that one should endeavour to combat this evil by propaganda. Well, with due respect, propaganda is useless. It has gone far beyond the point where it can have any effect at all. It is now a profitable and very well organized trade, and it is not an exaggeration to say that in certain areas of this division (notably Bahumunu and between Afunatam and Bansara) there is hardly a family which has not an interest in it. This becomes obvious to anybody stationed on the Cross River, and I have recently made certain enquiries with a view to obtaining details.\

In addition, the officer was forced to reveal that the commercial sex business was yielding huge revenues for the families of those involved, citing the instance of a young lady who made more than eighty pounds within a short period of time. Besides, he attributed the flourishing mailing business in the area to the sex business, because the people needed the facilities to keep “in touch with their itinerant gold mines” for financial and logistical assistance. Finally, the officer attributed the indifference of the affected communities to their apparent satisfaction with gains accrued from overseas remittances.

The impact of the sex industry on Nigeria and the Gold Coast

The sex industry affected Nigeria and the Gold Coast in several ways. For instance, a report by the colonial authorities of the Eastern Provinces highlighted some of the implications of the human trafficking and commercial sex trade on the communities in the area. Firstly, the report argued that the sex industry affected the birthrate in the Eastern Provinces because most of those involved in the trade were considered ‘barren or sterile’.

While this was not statistically explained, it nevertheless suggests the impact of the mass emigration on the demographic structure of the affected communities as well as the moral and cultural effects of commercial sex activities on their marriage institution. For instance, there were indications that the sex industry affected the marriage system.

---

64 CSO: 36005/89, File No. OB. 503/2, from the District Officer, Obubra Division, to the Resident, Ogoja Province, Ogoja, “Cross River Harlots”, 7 February 1941, NAI; CSO: 36005/86, No. 303/132, from the Secretary’s Office, Eastern Provinces.
65 Ibidem.
66 CSO: 36005/89, File No. OB. 503/2, from the District Officer, Obubra Division.
of the affected communities because it effectively prevented the recognition of any permanent marriage ties.

While there is no direct evidence to substantiate the aforementioned claim, records of the Native Court system indicate that eight out of every ten marriages in the affected communities did not get the necessary consent from parents. Rather, there were arrangements between people who planned to live together for a given period. Such marriages could be terminated anytime. Because of this practice, some parents desisted from collecting bride prices on their daughters in order not to be compelled to refund it in case their daughters defaulted. Secondly, the situation created by the human trafficking and sex trade led to a dependent socio-economic system at the level of the sending communities to such an extent that the people in those communities neglected their primary economic pursuit, which was agricultural and depended on earnings from the commercial sex workers. This became so worrisome that the District Officer of Obubra had to warn the elders, who depended on the earnings of commercial sex workers, to desist from such or they would face police prosecution. In addition, he condemned a situation whereby, “elders of the area collected a ‘harlot fee’ of two pounds from every woman practising on the Gold Coast and absolute ‘expenses’ in the Native Courts in the event of divorce.”

What should be acknowledged is that the elders and women of those communities were ostensibly caught up in the complex nature of the colonial economy, which transformed social relations among Africans and introduced new ways of doing things. Hence, the struggle for survival became the order of the day. This may explain why several young girls who were trafficked from Nigeria to the Gold Coast were forced into slave labour, sexual exploitation and other forms of dehumanizing treatment by the traffickers. Many of them were forced to sell their bodies as prostitutes for the benefit of the traffickers.

Thirdly, on parts of the Gold Coast, Nigerian commercial sex workers provided migrant mine workers some level of psychological and social comfort. For instance, migrant workers who traveled without their wives and families craved attention, which was easily provided by many of the commercial sex workers. Indeed, these people arguably faced a series of adverse conditions encompassing socio-economic challenges and the need of some form of psychological comfort, which the commercial sex workers provided. This probably explains why some

67 Ibidem.
69 CSO: No. 36005/93, from Colonial Secretary’s Office, Accra, to the Honourable Chief Secretary to the Government of Nigeria, Lagos, 24 January 1944, NAI.
70 Ibidem.
concerned authorities on the Gold Coast complained about the effect, which the sex industry had on the labourer’s pocket and health conditions, in terms of venereal diseases. Nevertheless, there is no gainsaying that the sex industry, to some extent served certain purposes for the Gold Coast society.

Conclusion

The development of the Nigerian sex industry on the Gold Coast started as part of the general trend of regular and irregular migration in West Africa. This article has shown that the phenomenon of mass emigration from Nigeria started from a simple migration pattern until it assumed the structure of organized human trafficking, which helped to build the sex industry in the area. The work highlights some of the strategies employed by the traffickers to recruit young women for the sex industry. Moreover, the findings of the article indicate that the Nigerian sex industry on the Gold Coast was sustained by the continuous migration and trafficking of women, especially from the south-eastern part of Nigeria. The known modus operandi of the trade was secretive, but there were cases of community culpability in the processes of kidnapping, enticement, recruitment, and transport of women and children for sexual exploitation. Available evidence indicates that some of the communities facilitated the emigration of ladies to the Gold Coast because of pecuniary interest. However, what is obvious is that during the colonial period women had arguably commanded some level of power and influence through their sexuality. In that regard, some of them considered the commoditization of some elements of their sexuality as a survival strategy within the socio-economic structure of colonialism.

In contrast, Nigerian ethnic associations, most of whose members were linked by common descent, residential propinquity or simply by moral affinity, took upon themselves the onerous task of sensitizing Nigerians to the adverse effects of irregular migration, human trafficking and commercial sex activities. They also sensitized the colonial authorities to apply the necessary official measures to address the so-called triple issues. In general terms, by connecting illicit migration with human trafficking and commercial sex activities between Nigeria and the Gold Coast, the current work illuminates an issue that has shaped contemporary migration studies.
Women’s Rights in the Absence of New Middle Class Support in Iran

Abstract

With the rise of a new middle class, women’s social and political activities have increased in Iran. Women became involved in the struggle for social and political freedom along with the new middle class during both the Constitutional and Islamic revolutions. However, women’s rights have not been high on the list of new middle class priorities. Consequently, the lack of new middle class support has negatively affected women’s social rights particularly after the Islamic revolution. This is important bearing in mind that increasing women social activities was an aim of the Pahlavi dynasty, but since the Islamic revolution, the state has limited women’s social participation. In light of this fact, this paper seeks to understand the reasons behind the lack of support from the new middle class to women, particularly after the Islamic revolution.

Introduction

The new Iranian middle class turned towards leftist ideologies and became a facilitator for the Islamic revolution which became religious.1 Before the Islamic revolution, the majority of the new middle class were western educated with a secular outlook. Although the revolution was a multi-class phenomenon in which the people of Iran rose en-masse against the regime, it was a Shi’a religious establishment that in fact directed and then took control of the revolution. Following the movement, the middle class including more traditional elements, considered Shi’a as a revolutionary and political religion. Therefore, the middle class became more revolutionary based on Shi’a ideology.2

The application of the Islamic system has introduced deep changes within Iranian society, transforming the institutional system, education and the judicial and political systems among others. However, many years after the Islamic revolution, the middle class tried to change the role of religion in life from a revolutionary religion to a reformed religion. It has developed a new set of

---


attitudes towards religion. The new attitudes are marked by some acceptance of the interference between politics and religion but not totally.

This approach in some ways has affected women’s rights. This is because, though the new middle class believes in women’s social activities, it still does not support the rights of secular women such as those who do not see wearing a hijab as mandatory.

**Iranian women social activities and the middle class: an overview**

Iranian women did not play significant roles in politics and society almost until the end of the nineteenth century. Society and the public sphere was not found in women’s activities. The traditional middle class majority were against women’s social and economic activities. The traditional middle class which included the bazaar (urban merchants) and the ulama (clerics) were in fact uneducated, or semi-educated. During the late 19th century, economic changes led to a significant transformation in the social structure by the establishment of modern education. The result of the emergence of modern education seems to have been the promotion of the intellectual as a sub group of the modern middle class.

At this time some sporadic activities were organized by women, although in most cases, they were mobilized by men. During the Constitutional revolution (1906–1911), for the first time in Iran’s history, women organized some activities by themselves, through their own initiatives. The Iranian women’s participation in the Constitutional revolution (Mashroteh revolution) ranged from constitutionalist and nationalist, as well as to anti-constitutionalist activities through to varying forms of feminism. Thus, in a similar vein to other women’s movements of the time in developing countries, Iranian women mobilized themselves as nationalists, to free Iran from despotism and to liberate themselves, as women and feminists, from patriarchy and the tragic conditions of their lives. Therefore, from the very start of the political disturbances, women in different parts of the country joined public protests. After the Mashroteh Movement in 1906, the urban middle- and upper-class women were allowed limited social and political participation. Female participation in politics has also been witnessed since then, and they regularly publish a journal called *Nesvan* (Women).

---


4 Ibid., p. 50.

With the collapse of the Qajar dynasty, women’s role in affecting social change increased under the Pahlavi dynasty. The changing and increasing role of women and their participation in the public sphere was a result of modernization processes which were initiated by Reza Shah Pahlavi. The new king encouraged women to get as much education as possible and to participate in social activities and the economy even as part of the labour force at all levels. As early as 1932, Iranian women held a meeting of the Oriental Feminine Congress in Tehran at which they called for the right of women to vote, compulsory education for both boys and girls, equal salaries for men and women, and an end to polygamy. After 1936, when the Reza Shah Pahlavi banned the hejab (chador), veiling came to be perceived among the minorities of the elite and secular middle class women as a symbol of oppression.

Reza Shah tried to abolish all visible symbols of traditionalism, such as the veil and the native attire for men, and to replace them with Western dress and headgear. This was due to the fact that despite the westernization policy which had been started during the Naser al-Din Shah Qajar (1831–1896), Iranian society was still an orientated nation. For instance, the upper class was interested in modern life but its members personal habits and activities remained overwhelmingly Persian. In addition, due to direct relations with foreigners, the merchant class was impressed by the western lifestyle, while the impact was limited and it was displayed much less than the city-dwelling landed aristocracy.

However, the main impact of the Reza Shah’s modernization policy was the rise of the new urban middle class. This new urban middle class were a minority, but they became the voice and political conscience of Iran. They had made significant inroads into the medieval order of Iranian society. The economic developments improved the new middle class, whose political orientation and economic philosophies were different from those of the traditional elites. In addition, the processes of modernization were in tune with secularization and were accompanied by a strong and growing trend, regarding criticism of Islam and especially of Shi’ism and “clerical fanaticism”. The Reza Shah applied this process through reforms to constitution and law, closing religious schools and isolating clerics in the major cities. For instance, the clergy’s judicial powers

---

6 A chador is a full-body-length semicircle of fabric that is open down the front. This cloth is tossed over the woman’s or girl’s head, but then she holds it closed in the front.


8 Ibidem.

were increasingly reduced. In fact, the clergy lost a particularly vital source of revenue when a law reassigned the registration of legal documents concerning property, from the Sharia courts to the secular courts. This law forced many members of the clergy to seek secular employment. As a result the ulama, as a part of the traditional middle class, was weakened during the Reza Shah.

Mohammad Reza Shah continued the modernization of the country after his father. In 1963, he outlined a six-point reform program (the ‘White Revolution’) at the National Congress of Rural Cooperatives in Tehran. The sixth point concerned amendments to election laws granting voting rights to women. The Immediate impact of women’s enfranchisement was seen in the representation of six women in the Majlis, and two women in the Senate, both within a year. By 1968 the first woman cabinet member had also been appointed. Moreover, the Family Protection Law, promulgated in 1967, was an important statute of reform pertaining to women and the family in Iran and in the entire Middle East.

The reforms were initiated by the state, however the traditional middle class, particularly the ulama, opposed the improving women’s social activities. However, with the rise of new middle class and the increase in their political requirements, women’s political participation became greater than before and led them to become more active in politics. Thus, with the rise of authoritarianism Iranian women became major participants in the Islamic Revolution (1979). Most activists were professional women of the secular middle class, from among whom political antagonists to the regime, over a long period, were recruited. However, Iranian attempts to change through revolution did not improve women’s status and actually limited women’s political and social freedoms.

The Islamic Revolution and women’s rights

Following the revolution, the situation of women changed. The main social group to inherit political power -the traditional middle class, particularly the ulama - valued most highly the traditional role of women in a segregated society.

12 Ibid., p. 114.
Iran’s constitution controls both the public and private lives of women. The main sign is a specific public clothing framework under Islamic codes, which has become mandatory in Iran. It can be seen as an example of the control of the government on the lives of women.

As a matter of fact, during the revolution, many middle and upper class women saw the scarf and chador as unifying factors among women. Therefore, in order to show solidarity with the economically lower class women, who have traditionally been more religious, the middle and upper class women started wearing a scarf or chador in demonstrations. This was perceived by many women as a weapon they utilized against the Shah to demonstrate their unity.”

However, many of the women who wore the veil as a protest symbol did not expect the *hejab* to become mandatory. Thus, when the first calls were made in February 1979 to enforce *hejab* wearing, and the Ayatollah Khomeini was quoted as saying that he preferred to see women in modest Islamic dress, many women were alarmed.

However, according to the new rules, women were still allowed to vote and hold parliament and cabinet positions if they met the proper qualifications, but limitations on their lives were legalized in laws prohibiting women from the presidency, leadership, judiciary and certain educational fields, and also regarding inheritance laws. This policy extended to other areas of women’s lives, based on the theories of Islamization. Islamization was meant to cleanse the country of the decadent Western culture that had infected its body and soul. Islamization was meant to take Iran back to its roots, traditions, and culture, a culture of course solely limited to its Islamic past. Regarding women’s rights, the constitution viewed women through the lens of Islamic ideology, and upon closer scrutiny, it is clear that these constitutional provisions do not recognize women as individuals but rather as “family” and “women as mothers and wives”. According to the Iranian Human Rights Documentation Center, for instance, the language of Article 21 of the Constitution (Women’s Rights) reflects the deep roots of patriarchy which views women as human beings with undeveloped personalities who only fit traditional roles in a family:

“The government must ensure the rights of women in all respects, in conformity with Islamic criteria, and accomplish the following goals:

---

14 Ibidem.

15 Eventually, women were allowed to act as advisors to the official judge in cases that involved family matters, and were allowed to give their opinion on the situation, but were not allowed to decide on the sentence given.

1) Create a favourable environment for the development of a woman’s personality and the restoration of her rights, in both the material and intellectual spheres;
2) The protection of mothers, particularly during pregnancy and child-rearing, and the protection of children without guardians;
3) Establishing competent courts to protect and preserve the family;
4) The provision of special insurance for widows, senior women, and women without support;
5) Granting the guardianship of children to worthy mothers, in order to protect the interests of the children, in the absence of a legal guardian”.

Thus, while soon after the establishment of the Islamic Republic, the Islamic government planned to send women back home to their traditional roles as mothers and wives, two major incidents changed the situation. The first was economic sanctions against Iran and the second war with Iraq. The hostage crisis led to U.S. economic sanctions, and the United States supported Saddam Hussein in his attack on Iran, resulting in a war that lasted eight years and claimed many lives. As disastrous as this time was for the country, it meant that the Ayatollah needed all the support he could muster. Once again, he turned to his very loyal constituency—the women of Iran.

After the Iran and Iraq war, the result of the new situation as well as wealth from oil revenue brought uneven economic and social development in the cities, and the rate of the newly educated middle class increased. This new middle class demanded social and political freedoms which finally led to victory for reformist groups and reformation started. As a result of the women’s struggle, reforms were made in relation to women’s education and employment. Therefore, as opposed to the early years of the revolution, when the government made many restrictions for female students regarding university entrance which led to a sharp decline in their progress, the new situation led to gender consciousness and women’s struggle for change.

Consequently the levels of female education and health became greater under the Islamic state, than they were at the height of westernisation and modernisation in the 1960s and 1970s. In addition, according to statistics the percentage of female students at all levels increased significantly during the 15

---

17 The Constitution of Islamic Republic of Iran, Article 21.
years from 1995–2010. The percentage of women accepted into universities and higher education institutions rose from 32.5 per cent in 1976 to 59.9 per cent in 2007 a rise of more than 80 per cent.

Although women achieved some of their aims as a result of reformations, it seems that Iranian women have not received enough support from the new middle class in removing their social and political limitations which have been imposed by the Islamic state. This is why such limitations have moved women to consider civil rights as their first priority for change.

**Women’s rights and the middle class**

The social classes and political groups have played significant roles in the Islamic revolution. The role of political groups from different parts of society, including the middle class (both traditional and new) and the working class, have been important elements in the formation of the current situation of women in Iran. These roles include:

**The influences of Islamization on the new middle class:** as mentioned before, the new middle class and traditional middle class (both clerics and bazaar) have been considered as an outcome of the existence and the activation of a civil society, as well as its conflict with the ruling regime behind the Islamic Revolution. However after the Islamic Revolution, the coalition between the new middle class and the traditional middle class, particularly regarding Shi’a clerics, was highly unstable and very soon the coalition was replaced by conflict. The powerful, dominant Shi’a clerics dismissed the new, urban middle class from power. In addition, with the defeat of the left and the liberals in 1980 and their elimination from the political landscape in 1981, the Islamists imposed their rules. They were revolutionary and therefore the country was led ideologically. This approach affected women’s rights more than other sectors of society. This can be seen through their approach towards *hejab* garments.

During the initial years after the Islamic revolution and as a result of women’s protests and the support from the left and liberals, the ruling on *hejab* wearing was rescinded — but only temporarily. However, later in the absence of support

---


from the main left-wing and liberal political groups, the Islamists were able to make veiling compulsory and to enforce it harshly.22

The majority of the new middle class did not support the women’s struggles. It seems that they turned revolutionary as an influence of the revolutionary environment. Some scholars consider the domination of anti-west ideology on the new middle class as the reason behind not supporting the women’s struggle. According to this opinion, not wearing the *hejab* was not only a symbol of defiance of the regime, but it was a way of making a personal statement. It was influenced by the idea of some leaders of the new middle class such as Dr. Ali Shariati. The term “Westoxification” (*gharbzadegi*) was coined by Dr. Ali Shariati and the anti-Western movement that had started to slowly take shape in the early sixties was in full bloom in 1979.23 This idea was even followed by leftist Marxist and national, religious (Meli-Mazhabi) groups.

It is important to know that the new middle class families considered Islam a desirable alternative. The shifting patriarchal character towards public patriarchy made the lifestyle of the home caring role of traditional Muslim women obsolete. Honouring the notion of the traditional family, Islam revived the gender identity of these women. Even the professional women of the new middle class, who were active in clandestine political and guerrilla warfare against the Shah and also fighting against discrimination and social injustice after the revolution, have been stopped by the Islamists. What the Islamists opted for however, was to restore the prerogatives men enjoyed under private patriarchy and the obligations women undertook according to the traditional patriarchal bargain. Islamists were originally opposed to women’s presence in social and political activities.

**The new middle class priorities:** Whilst in the first decade the country was ruled by revolutionary ideology, reformation was started by Hashemi Rafsanjani in the 1980s. Rafsanjani advocated a free market economy. With the state’s coffers full, he pursued an economic liberalization policy. Also, he tried to attract western investment and reduce the government’s dominant role in the economy through privatization. Subsequently, Rafsanjani and Mohammad Khatami focused too closely on the cultural and political demands of the new middle class. However, Khatami and his lieutenants were never able to transform this system into a coherent force for pro-democratic governance. Mahmood Ahamdinejad’s government (2005–2009) had a plan to create a new middle class and replaced it by an urban middle class which was raised during the Rafsanjani and Khatami

---

22 Rashti, ‘Women and Education…’

eras. He marginalized the new middle class and as a result the new middle class tried to justify its presence by supporting Mir Hossein Moussavi, a candidate of the reformist groups. On 23 June 2009, a spontaneous mass demonstration erupted in Iran against the officially declared victory of Mahmoud Ahmadinejad, in what was perhaps the most publicly contested presidential election in the history of the Islamic Republic. The following day, the victorious Ahmadinejad staged an official demonstration in support of the declared victory.

On 25 June 2009, Iran witnessed a huge mass rally against the status quo which eventually emerged as the defining moment of an uprising that its supporters have called the “Green Movement”. While it was an attempt for reformation, the government reaction however was excessively harsh. The nominal leaders of the uprising were systematically arrested, subjected to ‘kangaroo courts’ and jailed.

The rise of a strong women’s movement is a result of reforms, which have been struggling for gender equality within the democracy movement since 1990. During the Rafsanjani era, a new approach evolved regarding women’s issues. The establishment of new institutions such as the Women’s Bureau, affiliated to the Presidential Office, was a stepping stone in the assessment and implementation of plans on women’s issues, and it was during the official course of this Bureau that the measures taken laid the foundation for future actions. The Women’s Bureau in the Presidential Office was transformed into the Centre for Women’s Participation (CWP), which played an extremely effective role in integrating gender perspectives in national policy-making. Alongside the activities of the CWP, the Women’s Committee in the provinces has become active in handling women’s issues within the infrastructure of the government’s decentralization policies.

However, even during this time, the struggles for women’s rights were only taking place in a handful of the big cities and with a lack of support from different political groups. Although the reformist groups, seen as representative of the new middle class, have announced that one of their priorities is furthering women’s rights and freedoms, they were not directly involved in the struggle for women’s rights. Noushin Ahmadi Khansari, an Iranian researcher and women’s activist, believes that “…since the Islamic Revolution, supporting women’s rights has been an aim of the new middle class. This is because the limit of political and social freedom effects families and consequently society. However this support does not include all female requests, especially those specifically related to women such as the wearing of the hejab.”

25 Noushin Ahmadi Khansari in an interview with the author.
It seems that since the 2009 elections the situation, according to Noushin Ahmadi Khansari, became worse, “…Many civil-rights activists are in jail or have suspended sentences hanging over their heads or are regularly summoned for interrogations; many others have been forced to leave the country. So things are different from that year when we campaigned for the collection of One Million Signatures in 2006”.26 She argues further that, “…at that time the state tolerated some of our activities, but all the extensive censure and international sanctions against the government of Iran that followed the 2009 elections – and, unfortunately, the intensified hostility between Iran and the international community – all this has led not only to pressure on the women’s movement but to uncertainty and deadlock within society as a whole.”

Therefore it is not strange to see how in the absence of women’s rights, any attempts for democratization fails. This is because, the country cannot develop if the requests and rights of half the members of its population are ignored or are considered as demands from second class citizens. Thus, there is no doubt that the new middle class must consider women’s rights as an important factor in the process of democratization across the country.

Some Remarks on the Transport Services in Selected Cities in Nigeria and Benin

Abstract

This article presents changes in the public sphere which take place in cities in the Federal Republic of Nigeria and in the Republic of Benin. These changes concern the service of public and private transport. Due to new regulations and traffic codes prepared by state administration with involvement from the business sector, international standards of service are introduced into two selected African countries. They influence new social behavior of individuals. The changes improve standards of road security among passengers and drivers. They also increase the level of expectations of African clients as far as the quality of transport in their countries is concerned. To illustrate aforementioned changes, I refer to my material collected during my field research carried out in Nigeria and Benin in 2011.

Introduction

In terms of widely understood mobility concepts, which could be professional, class, communication and space; it is beyond doubt that mobility verifies social and economic development in contemporary Africa. New technologies in free markets and importation of non-African models of management contribute to such situations. These models of management currently become a conscious choice to make use of the most effective organizational practices as verified in western countries. Social changes are caused by internal migration from country areas to urban regions and by international migration between African, European, American and Asian countries. The phenomenon of the growth of the middle class in our described countries is recognized as a powerful factor. In Nigeria, the beginning of the middle class dates back to the seventies. It was an indirect result of the discovery of crude oil fields in the south Nigeria. The so called petroleum boom contributed to a quick increase in the level of urbanization and higher education. Currently the middle class includes persons

* PhD, Researcher at the Institute of Mediterranean and Oriental Cultures, Polish Academy of Sciences, e-mail: mbakalarska@iksio.pan.pl.

1 This work was prepared with the support of financial funds for the statute activity of the Institute of Mediterranean and Oriental Cultures in Polish Academy of Sciences. The funds contribute to the development of young researchers.


who live in urban areas and have attained a higher education (in 2011 high
school graduates constituted 47.2 per cent of Nigerian society).\(^4\) They work in
the public sector (76 per cent of the people in the research sample of 1000 were
considered to be middle class members), or they manage their own company
with up to five employees (18.9 per cent of the research sample)\(^5\) and they spend
$10 to $20 daily per person.\(^6\) During my field research in 2011 in Nigeria and
Benin, I talked to owners and employees of transport companies. I also talked to
passengers travelling with local and international transport companies. There are
big differences between these two countries. Nigeria, a former British colony,
develops quickly comparing to other countries in this region. Oil fields are one
of the reasons for this quick development. Neighbouring Benin is smaller, poorer
and generally more quiet. I presented examples of participating observations
carried out in Porto-Novo and Cotonou, two main cities in the Republic of
Benin, from the perspective of strategic communication points on the important
international highway route from Accra to Lagos. However, I concentrated
my article mainly on a description of the phenomena taking place in Nigerian
Lagos, the biggest metropolis of Sub-Saharan Africa, which is located in the
south-west of the country. My decision is connected with a willingness to share
the results of my observations of important changes which took place in the
described region during three years, from 2008 to 2011, in the period between
my visits to that region.

**International land transport**

After 2000, a network of private companies was developed. They offered
land transportation between the main cities in the Gulf of Guinea.\(^7\) What could
be found behind these private initiatives? American logistics, British standards
of service and a new approach to customer service, are the main features of this
private initiative. I carried out over 30 interviews with owners and employees
of a few private and (two) state transportation companies in bus stations in
Lagos, Abuja, Sokoto, and Kano (all in Nigeria) and in the Republic of Benin in

\(^4\) Robertson Charles, Ndebele Nothando and Mhango Yvonne, *A Survey of the Nigerian
Middle Class*, Nairobi: Renaissance Capital, 2011, p. 15.
\(^5\) Ibid., p. 16.
\(^6\) *The Rise of the African Middle Class*, Published by Deloitte, 2013, [http://www2.deloitte.
com/content/dam/Deloitte/au/Documents/international-specialist/deloitte-au-aas-rise-african-
\(^7\) Emman Funlayo Ogunbodebe, ‘Urban Road Transportation in Nigeria from 1960 to
2006: Problems, Prospects and Challenges’, *Ethiopian Journal of Environmental Studies and
Cotonou and Porto-Novo. These companies offered local connections between cities and international transport hub connections. The interviews were informal and they were not recorded. The majority of informants allowed me to note their opinions. Some informants told me their personal data, although in order to keep natural conditions which facilitated a spontaneous expression of views, I did not ask everyone to tell me their age, education level and religion. However, I asked additionally about their experiences when travelling abroad and about training undertaken by non-African non-governmental organizations.

During these talks, tales about travel to the USA and Europe were underlined. The scenario in many cases was the same. A member of the middle class worked for a few years in a family business and then he went to the United States of America, to Great Britain or France. When staying abroad he increased his wealth but he also gained new experience. Nigerians and inhabitants of Benin were amazed whenever they were abroad about the quality of public transport available in American, British and French cities. They also underlined that there were timetables available on websites and therefore on mobile phones. Other issues pointed out by respondents who were owners of local transport companies and had returned to Africa, concerned the level of service of companies offering long distance routes. Such features included WiFi on board, television screens showing DVDs, and on board meals and drinks services. Such services greatly amazed African migrants. Migrants returned home with larger sums of potential investment capital and they decided to establish transportation companies in order “to show Africa how to travel comfortably”.  

One of the biggest and best known transportation companies in Nigeria and in the Republic of Benin is Cross Country. This company offers connections between the south and the north of Nigeria and the capitals of Togo and Ghana. Actually travel with Cross Country offers high standards of customer service. New minibuses, most of which are of the Mercedes make, are air-conditioned and equipped with television screens. Meals are served in hygienic, single use containers with bottles of mineral water. Printed timetables match the actual departure time of buses. Not only the quality of service is important but also the welfare of the employees, an issue which will be discussed in the latter part of this paper. Employees are a key element in a new dynamically developing transportation sector in West Africa. Employees of transport companies differ as far as their social status is concerned. Employees in lower professional positions who are in charge of ticketing offices, inspectors and those employed for customer service, do not meet all the criterion features of the middle class. One such factor refers to level

---

8 A quotation of a Cross Country employee aged around 40 and married with three children. An employee with an elementary education, who was employed in a customer service department.  
of education and just a basic elementary education is generally representative of employees. However, those employed in managerial positions are sometimes better educated than the owners of private companies, who may compete thanks to gathered capital and thanks to investment in economic activities. It is worth mentioning that the owners of such companies had to show that their businesses were viable not only due to funding but also because of their organizational abilities, which is not easy to do in the corrupted African environment.

Employee training represents another western standard introduced into local companies. Such training enables employees to follow protocol guidelines, how to react under special circumstances (for example whenever there are delays) and how to underline their identification with the company. A uniform showing the colours of the company and its logo, are external symbols of this identification.

Religion in travelling

The expression of religious feelings in public is a very important element in the analysis of this subject matter. Long distance routes in Nigeria and Benin can be dangerous and therefore passengers need spiritual support in the form of blessings and prayers before their trip. Nobody is surprised by the presence of a pastor on duty, sometimes there are even a few pastors who compete with each other at local bus stations. They enter the bus which is about to depart, read the Bible, bless the travelers and await offerings which are generously bestowed on them. “We Nigerians have to recall God’s mercy because travelling is dangerous here. Either your bus breaks down due to a hole in the road or police stop you and they will look for a pretext to get a bribe from a driver or you may be attacked by a gang of thieves. Even the army attacks to get additional pocket money. What can you do then? You may only trust God”. Therefore prayers are common during travel. Passengers, no matter what religion, ask and noisily pray together for a safe journey. Once they direct prayers to Allah and then onto Christ. Such situations could be seen in and around the area of Abuja, the capital of Nigeria, located in the central part of the country, all the way down to the southern regions, where historically Christianity dominates. In the northern states of Nigeria, despite the presence of Christians, such ecumenical expressions in the public sphere do not take place. To the north of the capital,

---

10 A quotation from one of the passengers travelling with God is Good Motors. This is a married woman around 55 years old who has four children, and is a believer of one of the Pentecostal churches. She has a secondary education and is a teacher.
the regions are dominated by Islam and the prayers during transportation \textit{in situ} in cities and on international routes are conducted individually and discreetly.

An attachment to religion is so characteristic of African people that modern business men with big ideas and innovations can exploit this attachment to gain a larger number of customers. This policy is visible in one of the Nigerian transportation companies with a seat in city Benin (the area to the south of Nigeria). The owners of this company, a married couple, decided to cater for both the comfort and also the spiritual needs of their passengers. On one hand, the name of the company God is Good Motors clearly refers to the religious nature of their customers. On the other hand, the owners of the company introduced US influenced standards of service based on what they experienced during their stay in the States. Competition for customers started with the building of modern bus stations with air conditioned rooms in which satellite televisions were installed. Trained managers gave professional advice about timetable. Employees of each private company wear uniforms with the company’s logo. The constantly busy cleaners in the departure halls, have personal name badges.

It has to be mentioned, that such standards are not found everywhere. The aforementioned company God is Good Motors is a market leader of transportation services in Nigeria. “Our company is a family business. Everybody takes care of the quality of customer service. The managers introduce a good atmosphere and they organize training for us. Though there are many customers there is no stressful atmosphere in the working place. Maybe in future I will start my own transportation business and then I will have big knowledge and experience”.

However, the majority of bus stations are close to open air markets and there are agreed bus stops instead of officially designated bus stops. The photo below presents an example of such bus stations used by private bus companies which offer intercity routes in the southern areas of Abuja. This bus station seems to show the traditional chaotic features of bus stations, without a roof for instance, combined with modern features such air-conditioning. The photo clearly shows an area separated for the needs of mobile ticket desks, which here are comprised of plastic tables with chairs protected against rain and sun rays by a huge parasol in the shape of a roof. Such working places are very popular in many African countries and they are used as customer service points. In Lagos, customer service points for the less well-off are known as ‘business centers’.

\[\textit{11} \] The opinion of one of the employees of the company God is Good Motors, a 25 year old customer service manager and a student of master degree studies at the Department of Business and Management at The University of Benin. He is unmarried with no children.
Urban transport

Benin is not as affluent as neighbouring Nigeria, and it is therefore less developed. However, the quality of the transport infrastructure is quite good as far as African\textsuperscript{12} conditions are concerned. The two main cities of the Republic of Benin, Cotonou and Porto-Novo, are more suburban than the previous capital of the country. These cities do not have public urban transport. The inhabitants use their own cars and bicycles. People who cannot afford such vehicles, use the well-developed network of private taxis which in this region are called \textit{okada}.\textsuperscript{13}

\textit{Okadas} are the most common means of transport in Nigerian cities as in many sub-Saharan African countries. This kind of urban transport is very efficient, particularly in overpopulated capitals with big traffic jams. \textit{Okadas} offer a swift but also risky mode of transport.\textsuperscript{14} In Abuja, the capital of Nigeria, there is a very restrictive law indicating areas where these motor-taxis may be used. In Lagos, the volume of traffic has resulted in an increase in the number of two-wheel vehicles, which can navigate traffic jams on busy routes. Until 2010 it was permitted to transport not only people but also various types of large scale equipment. This proved quite risky for both passengers and the sheer volume of motorcycle taxis alike. There were no regulations concerning matters of traffic security.\textsuperscript{15} Since 2011 Babatunde Fashola, during his second term as a governor of State of Lagos, started to introduce law regulations in order to protect security and for a better life in the metropolis. Policemen were trained to execute new rules in traffic regulations. People driving private motorcycles and motorcycle taxis had to wear protective helmets.\textsuperscript{16}

---


\textsuperscript{16} It is worth mentioning that the local authorities also in other Sub Saharan African countries have tried to introduce, or they have already introduced traffic codes, according to which the drivers of motorcycles have to wear protective helmets. For example, in Kenya, the owners of motorcycle taxis known in East Africa \textit{as boda-boda} (it is Swahili equivalent of Nigerian \textit{okada}), use not only helmets but they also wear fluorescent waistcoats to be more visible on the road. However, in neighboring Tanzania, motorcycle taxi drivers are still not following the rules of on road safety. There was a committee concerning the subject of transport in Africa during the 25\textsuperscript{th} annual conference of the African Studies Association of the UK held at the Sussex University in
Some Remarks on the Transport Services in Selected Cities in Nigeria and Benin

vehicles offering transportation had to have an additional helmet for a passenger. In Lagos and in Abuja, unlike other cities in Nigeria, police stopped motorcycle vehicles whenever more than two people were being transported. Drivers were fined for the transportation of oversized objects, protruding out of both sides of the vehicle. Charges were introduced particularly in a few well-heeled districts in Lagos, for riding in a ‘woman position’ on a motorcycle, basically with both legs on one side of the bike.

Whenever police stopped people, who were contravening regulations, it was explained that such a situation is dangerous for passenger’s life. Obviously the inhabitants of the less well-off city districts did not observe the new regulations and it gave Nigerian guards a pretext to for bribes, which became common in Nigeria.

Corruption is so common in Nigeria that it slows down the process of implementing new regulations changes. Corrupted policemen particularly harass drivers of private buses (buses painted in yellow, known as danfo, used for urban transport and which became the symbol of the city just like New York’s famous yellow taxis. They often do not have the required confirmation of a technical inspection and the appropriate documents which permit their use. In these buses there are no windows and the doors do not close properly. Drivers take a number of passengers that are double the number of seats. Therefore, the police always have a reason to fine them. Usually the police use the excuse of keeping order at bus stops (at agreed places close to busy traffic routes in Lagos) and they come up to drivers to check documents. The majority of drivers try to negotiate the extent of the fines. The police are just waiting for such occasions, and when they start duty their supervisors order them to collect an ‘adequate’ amount of money which in fact means bribes. Bribes are supposed to

---

September 2014. The work of Benjamin Cambell, Tom Bishop and Jesse Heitner titled “The impact of Text Message (SMS) Reminders on Helmet Use among Motorcycle Drivers in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania” was presented during that committee. The work showed the results of research carried out by the organization http://www.amend.org/. The research aimed at indicating the impact of sending SMS to drivers of boda-boda’s with a reminder to use helmets. The message was prepared including three forms of important message delivery: 1) referring to ethical values, 2) referring to law restrictions, 3) referring to health consequences and financial charges for the family of a driver in case of accident or death. After a month, scientists evaluated their work among the researched group. It turned out that people who received messages referring to points 1 and 3 wore helmets more often.


‘support’ the low level police salaries. Usually passengers of controlled buses collect money and give it to the driver. The driver gives that money to the police with the expectation of being granted permission to depart. “Oiybo,” please be quiet, please do not make more problems, we are not in Europe, we have to do it that way here”. If anybody loudly protests against such methods of ‘settling the matter’ he is arrested and taken to the police station.

Such situations refer only to private transport services, which not long ago were the only form of transport allowing for travel within a metropolis of 15 million people. Since 2007, the governor Babatunde Fashola started a project to introduce to Lagos state owned and funded bus lines (known as LAGBUS). Initially, LAGBUS worked only in two districts and routes were limited. Only after 2010, did the network of blue and red buses begin to be developed. Marked bus stops with rooves were organized. Bus depots were also built. Drivers and licensed ticket vendors received identification badges. Tickets of different values with holograms were printed. Buses were equipped with electronic ticket punchers in contrast to private transport companies where there are no tickets and a passenger pays for an agreed journey distance.

The concept of the development of urban bus lines was carried out gradually within several stages. Logistics were based on examples of one of the American companies dealing with transport management. Representatives of this company came to Lagos in order to train employees and to show a system of organizing ticket sales, timetable schedule arrangement and preparation of time-sheets for drivers.

The everyday work of the drivers is controlled by employees of the bus lines. They have personal identification badges. The inhabitants of Lagos slowly got used to the new rules. Due to the fact that there is a big requirement for a transport service, chaotic queues are formed and sometimes people use force, unlike in other countries in East Africa where customarily passengers wait patiently and they stand in line. There is always a queue of waiting passengers at newly built bus stops with roof protection. Buses drive arrive every 10–15 minutes. Vehicles are air conditioned and they have comfortable upholstered seats with arms. Each stop is on request when a passenger presses a button.

It is worth mentioning, that during the author’s research in 2011, there was no formally organized water transport which could seem strange bearing in

---

19 In the Yoruba language the Word oyibo means “foreign”, and such a term is used by inhabitants of many regions of the South of Nigeria whenever they refer to foreigners.

20 A request of one of the commuters, who was on a bus with me when it was checked by the police, and it was her reaction to my protest against her offering a bribe.

mind the areas in the south of the city are located in a lagoon. However one year later, thanks to the decisions of the governor Babatunde Fashola, urban water tram lines were opened and operated by the Lagos State Ferry Services corporation.

Changes in the transport sector in Nigeria and Benin are influenced by models of business activities, learnt and brought to the country of origin by representatives of the middle class. It mostly refers to the level of service and implementation of world-wide customer service standards. Development of private urban transport, intercity and international transport, contributes to an increase in the mobility of less well-off inhabitants of Nigeria and Benin. It also improves their standard of life. Initiating such a development process is a condition to develop local companies. Patterns of development copied from the West help in the preparation of projects and in the implementation of effective methods, techniques and tools in the field of organization and management. The stimulation of such internal development processes is especially important in the context of Africa’s problem of dependency on external international aid. Aforementioned examples prove that when Nigerians start their own transport business, they cooperate with countries of the West in order to work independently. The situation regarding widespread corruption in Benin and Nigeria causes difficulties which may discourage enterprising individuals. We have to admit, that unquestionably Lagos and Abuja, the former and current capitals of Nigeria may be considered as leaders of change in this region. State authority initiatives including an introduction of new traffic regulations aiming at increasing road safety, gradually shape new attitudes and behavior in the public sphere of the chosen cities in Nigeria. The aforementioned governor Babatunde Fashola, contributed greatly to the processes of change in Lagos. In 2012 he initiated and helped set up a new radio station – Traffic Radio Station 96.1FM, which was the action of the Lagos State Traffic Management Authority. The station broadcasts live information about the most important places in the streets of the metropolis including notices about accidents that have occurred, usually resulting from the bad conditions of state roads.

Unfortunately, poor infrastructure is a problem. There is not only no comfort of driving, but such infrastructure increases the risks of traffic accidents due to the poor quality of the road surface, specifically potholes in the asphalt and the unhardened surfaces of smaller roads. However every year the situation is improving. New routes of fast traffic are built and a subway and cable railway line will be built as further forms of urban transport.23

---

22 http://www.lamata-ng.com/
23 Ibidem.
At the end of my work it is probably appropriate to quote a popular saying in Nigeria concerning travel: “It is not safe to travel in Nigeria. There are thieves and ‘area-boys’\textsuperscript{24} in the south-west part of the country, there are kidnappers and the ‘MEND’\textsuperscript{25} in the Niger Delta, and there is Boko Haram in the north of Nigeria.” In fact with such a travel forecast, anybody may be afraid to start a trip in this the most populated country of Sub-Saharan Africa. However, internal mobility and external migration has a long tradition among Nigerians.

\textsuperscript{24} The term area-boys refers to groups of young men, who prepare traps on roads to stop vehicles and steal money from passengers. On intercity roads they often have fire-arms and in Lagos they also attack pedestrians with knives.

\textsuperscript{25} MEND is an abbreviation of the name Movement for the Emancipation of the Niger Delta, an armed movement acting against European and American petrol companies conducting crude oil mining in the Niger Delta. Their attacks often end with the kidnapping of white people in order to obtain ransoms from the victims countries of origin by ‘conning’ money out of the victims employers.
Factionalism in Political Parties in Zimbabwe in the 21st Century: Origins and Dimensions

Abstract

Factionalism has emerged as one of the critical problems haunting Zimbabwean political parties in the 21st century. It is therefore the aim of this paper to analyse the origins and dimensions of factionalism in Zimbabwe’s political parties in the 21st Century. The researchers made extensive use of available literature based on newspaper articles, books and published journals. Major findings of this research indicate that there are several drivers of factionalism. In order to deal with factionalism and its ideological contestation between political parties in terms of succession, it is necessary to consider this at national, provincial and local levels as well addressing the ever continuing economic crisis bedevilling the country.

Introduction

Political parties in Zimbabwe in the 21st century have experienced a plethora of challenges which range from funding, external interference, ideological bankruptcy, and weak leadership among others. Factionalism has undisputedly emerged as one of the critical problems haunting Zimbabwean political parties in the 21st century. The central aim of paper is therefore to analyse the origins and dimensions of factionalism in Zimbabwe’s political parties in the 21st century. In essence, the paper aims to expose the fact that there are several factors causing factionalism within political parties emanating from organisational and personal issues within any given political party. In the final conclusion of this paper factionalism is seen as inherent within political parties as individuals are driven by greed, creed and need, especially given the inherent economic crisis that has hit Zimbabwe as it entered the 21st century. In order to address these there is a need for a clear cut succession plan within political parties and also that political parties should encourage debate on issues of leadership and policy within their internal organisation.

* Associate Professor in the Politics and Public Management Department in the Faculty of Social Sciences at Midlands State University, Zimbabwe, e-mail: chigorap2000@gmail.com
** Administrative Assistant in the International Relations Office at Midlands State University, Zimbabwe.
*** Lecturer in the Department of Development Studies at Midlands State University, Zimbabwe.
Historical background to factionalism in Zimbabwe

Factionalism in political parties in Zimbabwe is not synonymous with the 21st century as it existed even during the colonial times. The problem of factionalism was exacerbated by the colonial policy of divide and rule which was perpetuated by the colonial government. The failure of the Ndebele to protect their territory in the 1893 Anglo-Ndebele war was partly due to this consciousness of some of the Shona Chiefs refused to side with the Ndebele against the settlers. This policy augured well with the successive colonial governments as this ensured that a united force against the colonial governments would never be forged. The policy soon proved to be a partial success as it caused factionalism in political movements formed during the pre-independence era. The colonial governments infiltrated pre-independence political movements through the use of their secret service/intelligence, causing anarchy and despondency in the rank and file of these political movements.

There are many theories that have been propounded as to why the Zimbabwe African Peoples Union (ZAPU) split and this section of the paper will aim to help in unscrambling all the different reasons behind the 1963 split. ZAPU was formed as a political movement to liberate the Africans in Southern Rhodesia from the bondage of colonialism. The party constituted of people from the two main ethnic groups, the Shona and the Ndebele, the latter being the ethnic group from which the party president, Joshua Nkomo originated. Nkomo’s ethnic origin was used as ammunition against his leadership in the party as members from the Shona ethnic group felt that they should rule since they were in the majority.

In May 1963 before the Organisation of African Unity (OAU) meeting in Addis Ababa, Joshua Nkomo met a long-time friend, Mahammed Faiek, who warned him against the impending split when he asked: “Is ZAPU still one party? What tribe do you belong to?”

These sentiments served as a warning to Nkomo about what laid ahead. These questioning statements also seemed to suggest that his friend seemed to know of an impending split which was attributed to tribalism. When Nkomo arrived for the OAU meeting in Addis Ababa the reality dawned on him that fellow cadres in the party were plotting his demise. This was done during a time when the party was seeking a global audience through the press. It had been earlier agreed during a Central Committee meeting that the party would issue an official statement, though this did not happen as no speech had been prepared.

for Nkomo by Robert Mugabe, the incumbent Publicity Secretary at that time, and as a result Nkomo was forced to make an impromptu speech.²

The most harrowing experience of the plot to destabilize the party was witnessed by Joseph Msika, the then Deputy treasurer of ZAPU, who intercepted a circular which openly urged ZAPU to bring the “majority tribes” to the leadership of the party and to get rid of “Zimundebere” a derogatory term in Shona for ‘the old Ndebele man.’ According to Nkomo, in the villages of Southern Rhodesia, rivalry between the two ethnic groups barely existed and even in town the two groups openly mixed.³ In order to ascend to power, the protagonists in the party used the ethnic ‘trump card’ as a façade to gain political mileage and gain control of the party. Nkomo was accused of giving preference to Ndebele-speakers, an accusation which he rebuffed with contempt as he argued that the Central Committee, a powerful organ in the party, was dominated by Shona speakers.⁴

Efforts were made to remove Nkomo from the helm of the party through a central committee meeting resolution, which however failed to materialise. Nkomo then called for an official general congress, which was held on 10–11 August 1963, which resolved to keep Nkomo at the helm of the party and named him life president. Meanwhile the ‘dissidents’, led by Ndabaningi Sithole and Leopold Takawira, formed the Zimbabwe African National Union (ZANU), a move which angered ZAPU as they felt that Sithole and his followers had betrayed the principle of African solidarity. According to Shadreck Chipanga, ZAPU split after Nkomo expelled Robert Mugabe, Washington Malianga, Maurice Nyagumbo, Henry Hamadziripi, Enos Chikowore and Robert Marere, whilst he was still in Dar es Salaam, and that it was two days after this event that the party was formed.⁵ The party was based outside Southern Rhodesia and had the support of Julius Nyerere, the then President of Tanzania, who wanted a negotiated settlement as opposed to an armed struggle, a sentiment which ZAPU firmly supported. However conflict in the form of petrol bombing ensued in the townships between loyalist members of ZAPU and ZANU, actions which played well into the hands of the Rhodesian government as they perpetuated divisions through the use of the secret service in a bid to weaken both political entities.⁶ According to Ngwabi Bhebe, ZANU misdirected its energies against

---

² Ibid., p. 113.
³ Ibidem.
⁴ Ibid., p. 114
ZAPU instead of using violence against the real enemy, Rhodesian government.\(^7\) The orientation of ZAPU, in which there was a mixture of cadres who believed in war as a means to attain independence, as opposed to other groups of cadres who believed in negotiated settlement, all of whom were bound together simply because of their dislike of Nkomo, was ultimately bound to prove be a recipe for factionalism in the formation of any new political party.

After Nkomo’s incarceration on 16 April 1964, the party lacked clear leadership as efforts on the warfront were in a state of paralysis due to disagreements over the roles and powers of any perceived leadership, as well as the faltering relationships between the political and military wings of the party and the recruitment and training of cadres.\(^8\) According to Bhebe, a ZAPU guerrilla leader would be prepared to act to the extent of detaining and threatening to kill members of the ZAPU leadership if they did not resolve their differences. The divisions in the party had once again degenerated into an ethnic battle with the Shona on one side and the Ndebele and Kalanga on the other.\(^9\) The party came to a grinding halt and the guerrilla onslaught on the enemy was suspended until the party once again split in October 1971, when James Chikerema announced the formation of the Front for the liberation of Zimbabwe (FROLIZI) which was clearly a consequence and symptom of factionalism.\(^10\) Even the mediation actions by the Zambian government failed as the party was further split into factions led by leaders such as JZ Moyo, Chikerema and Mthimkhulu, alongside other members opting to join ZANU. The struggle for power had once again figuratively ripped the party into pieces; although some loyalists did remain making rebuilding efforts from the ruined aftermath.

Another party resulting from apparent factionalism was ZANU Ndonga. This party was formed after a split in ZANU due to a whole host of reasons which included ethnic and ideological differences. ZANU began to experience the problems of factionalism after the assassination of Herbert Chitepo on 18 March 1975, which saw Robert Mugabe ascend to power. Later in 1975 the party split along further ethnic lines, between the Ndebele led by Sithole, who pursued a more peaceful agenda, and the other Mugabe led faction which was more militant in its approach. After independence, ZANU Ndonga managed to win seats in Chipinge in the 1980, 1985, 1990, 1995, and 2000 parliamentary

---


\(^8\) Ibid., p. 25.

\(^9\) Ibidem.

elections, and subsequently lost these seats in 2005 after the founding father Ndabaningi Sithole died. After his death, the party was riddled with factionalism which paralysed the regional support which the party had earlier enjoyed since 1980.\(^\text{11}\)

Besides ZANU Ndonga, the ZUM (Zimbabwe Unity Movement) emerged out of the mainstream ZANU PF. The party was formed by a senior ZANU PF official Edgar Tekere, who was opposed and very critical of the way his party was dealing with issues. Tekere was dismissed from posts in the party a couple of times, the first being in 1981 when he was dismissed from his ministerial post but managed to retain the post of Secretary General, despite making controversial statements which skewed his relations with fellow party members and even the leadership. Tekere was largely seen as a leader of a rival faction within the party and was dismissed as Secretary-General on 9 August 1981, with Mugabe assuming the post.

Tekere was elected into the Central Committee in August 1984, a power decision making body in the party where he criticised corruption in the party and supported white commercial farmers bids to evict squatters from their land. Tekere was acrimoniously expelled for criticizing Mugabe’s dictatorial tendencies and sheltering corruption in government circles.\(^\text{12}\) An issue that agitated Tekere the most was when Mugabe advocated the setting up of a one party state which Tekere vehemently and publicly denounced as against the founding principles of the party. He broke ranks with ZANU PF to form the ZUM (Zimbabwe Unity Movement) which offered a free market platform against Mugabe’s communist-style economic planning. Tekere won 20 per cent of the vote but only 2 seats in parliament. After the 1995 elections the party was severely weakened with its members facing intimidation and death threats from opponents.\(^\text{13}\)

In 1993 the Forum Party was formed after breaking away from ZUM, the party being led by the Chief of Justice, Enock Dumbutshena. The party was classified as white and liberal and emerged as a formidable opponent to the ZANU PF, calling for the devolution of power and a smaller government.\(^\text{14}\) The party sought to level the political playing field through electoral reforms as the electoral field was heavily skewed in ZANU PF’s favour. The party succeeded


\(^{14}\) Ibid., p. 58.
in getting a justified nullification of municipal election results in Masvingo, Bulawayo and Harare. The party however, later suffered from the cancer of factionalism as it was based on a weak alliance between international capital and opposition, and as such it failed to mount a serious challenge to ZANU PF. The Forum Party suffered massive defections and splits from its rank and file and did not manage to win even a single seat in the 1995 election.

Contending issues in the 21st century

There is no single explanation to factionalism in any political party as there are always underlying causes. According to Sachikonye “The presence of factions in a party reflects differences in style, ideological outlook and tactical positions and leadership attributes amongst different groups that constitute a party”. Political parties in Zimbabwe have been split by individuals who push for their own self-serving interests. This is not a phenomenon synonymous to Zimbabwe alone but the world over as human nature dictates that one thinks of things that benefit themselves. According to Brian Raftopolous, “the trouble with Zimbabwean politics is that the actors are concentrating on gaining state power for its own sake, not serving the public good, hence personalised factionalism and self-centeredness”. The split of the MDC-T after the 2013 elections is a clear case of personal interests taking precedence over the genuine needs of the party. It had long been claimed that Tendai Biti, the Secretary General of the party, harboured strong ambitions of leading the party. The heavy defeat in the 2013 harmonised elections led to Biti and his followers to call for the ousting of party leader Morgan Tsvangirai. Tsvangirai was accused by members, who wanted leadership renewal, of failing to provide effective leadership, abusing party funds, and tarnishing the image of the party through sex scandals amongst other things. The split within the MDC has seen the party thrown into the abyss of political oblivion, in as much as ZANU PF, although still not strong in relative terms, still has enough political support to dislodge any opposition.

The Zimbabwean political arena has been polarised due to differences in ideology between different political actors thus leading to factionalism. The

---

15 Ibidem.
16 Ibidem.
2005 split in the MDC was a result of differences in ideology which had always been simmering since the formation of the party itself. According to Owen Gare, “The MDC was formed as a broad church encompassing a wide range of groups and opinions. It was an eclectic mix of trade unionists, academics, professionals, farmers, students and civil society activists, among others, who all had different interests and expectations other than the common objective of removing Robert Mugabe and ZANU PF from power, thus the MDC was largely a protest movement rather than a political party”. The vote on whether the MDC should participate in Senatorial Elections in 2006 played a major part in the split. Senate was reintroduced after Constitutional Amendment number 17 in 2005, after it had previously been abolished in 1987 when the ZANUPF government had argued that the legislative body served no purpose as it was merely a figurative rubber stamping organ. The MDC party leader Morgan Richard Tsvangirai had vehemently opposed the setting up of Senate. However, his Secretary General, Welshman Ncube supported its formation and lobbied fellow parliamentarians to support the senate’s reinstatement, and as such the first fissures and cracks in the party had started to appear. The question of whether to participate in Senate became another hotly contested issue with the Tsvangirai faction against participation, whereas Ncube supported participation, the issue going through two rounds of voting after the top six Executives of the party failed to reach a consensus. The first was the MDC National Council which voted 33–31 in favour and then the MDC Parliamentary caucus which came out as 21–19 against. After these divisive votes Tsvangirai refused to sanction the party to contest in Senatorial Elections and this proved to be the final straw, the dice had been cast and in October 2005 the party was split into two, one offshoot led by Tsvangirai and based in Harare, whilst the other was based in Bulawayo led by Ncube, who was succeeded by Professor Arthur Mutambara. In doing so, the party had also been split along tribal lines. This difference in opinion and ideology was a major set-back to the party as they did not have sufficient seats in parliament to advocate policy changes.

A major setback towards maintaining a united political party in 21st century Zimbabwe has been the problem of regionalism. No party has been spared by this cancer as it has eaten away at the very fabric of political actors in Zimbabwe. Political parties in Zimbabwe have tried to dispel notions of regionalist tendencies through integrating individuals from different regions; this strategy is a way courting voters to vote for the party on the basis that it is a nationalist party. The strategy has worked so far for most political parties in Zimbabwe in the absence of a federal state. The split in ZAPU in the 20th century was both ideological and

20 Ibidem.
Percyslage Chigora, Qinisani Phambili Bhebe, Tawanda William Chibanda

regionalist in nature and equally the basis for Dabengwa resuscitating the ZAPU party, which rendered the 1987 Unity Accord between ZANU PF and ZAPU ineffective, was regionalist. The same trend transcends to opposition politics in which one questions the strategic thinking behind installing Morgan Tsvangirai as leader of the MDC ahead of his conceivable ‘boss’ Gibson Sibanda, who was the leader of the ZCTU, the brainchild behind the formation of the MDC. The 2005 split in the MDC mirrored regionalism at its worst, as Tsvangirai’s camps’ headquarters remained in Harare and Ncube moved to Bulawayo.

Factionalism in Zimbabwean politics has destroyed the political careers of otherwise vibrant and politically gifted individuals; being linked to a faction has seen many being discarded into the proverbial dustbin of political existence. Reconciliation between factions that had earlier been split has proven impossible, as politics in Zimbabwe have been perceived as a career choice and a means of survival, thus when an individual is banished from a party, a replacement is quickly found. Unification talks have often broken down due to the fact that positions rendered vacant after a factional split have been filled and those left holding those positions are naturally unwilling to relinquish them. The unification talks before the 2008 harmonised elections, between the MDC faction led by Tsvangirai and the other Mutambara led offshoot, broke down due to issues relating to who would fill which positions.

The road to the top in Zimbabwean political parties is very narrow as the selection processes appear to be democratic in nature on paper, but in practice it is invariably skewed in favour of the incumbent. The lack of succession plans in Zimbabwean politics have inevitably led to the fuelling of factionalism, and opportunities to contest for the presidency of any political party have been met with stiff resistance through the silencing of descending voices. A culture of violence has continued and has been used to threaten and silence those who aspire to reach the epitome of power or question the legitimacy of those in power. Simba Makoni left ZANU PF and formed his own party called the Mavambo\Kusile\Dawn with the support from some ZANU PF members who also supported him after having his efforts to lead the party frustrated at the 2007 ZANU PF congress, which had reinstated Mugabe as the party’s candidate for the 2008 Harmonised elections. In 1997 Dzikamai Mavhaire was expelled from ZANU PF after calling for Mugabe to resign claiming that he had stayed in power for too long. Elton Mangoma, who called for leadership renewal after the heavy electoral defeat in the 2013 Harmonised Elections, was expelled by the national council for bringing the party’s image into disrepute. The expulsion

of Mangoma and other party members who supported the calls for leadership renewal, led to a split in the party with one side supporting Tsvangirai and the other Biti.

Fragmentation and politics of patronage are consequences of factionalism and the Zimbabwean experience has not been any different. The historical experiences of both the ZANU PF and the MDC parties show serious fragmentation which has resulted in the formation of small parties with no solid or perceivable identity besides that of being protest movements. In a bid to reward loyalists, a compromise on ones’ ability has been sacrificed so as to fill the void left by protagonists, and the new crop of leaders are rubber stamped at congress without the blessing of party hierarchy.

The imposition of candidates by the political elites has led to friction within political parties and their structures. According to K. Matlosa, “a conflict issue within political parties themselves is the lack of intraparty democracy, which in turn leads to some party members deserting the parties and contesting elections as independent candidates.”23 In a truly democratic society any leader must and should be subjected to scrutiny by the electorate through the ballot. The Zimbabwean party system has been corrupted by political officials who feel that they are too sacred to have their seats contested in primary elections. The MDC-T failed to hold primary elections for Senators and was thus forced to impose candidates on the electorate.24 This behaviour by political elites has created fissures and dissent amongst party members and prospective candidates, and has resulted in individuals running as independent candidates and leading breakaway factions, a prime example being Simba Makoni and the MDC-T debacle in the 2008 Harmonised Elections in the Midlands Province, where there were two factions, namely the Jatropha faction led by Patrick Kombayi and the Masowe faction led by Sesil Zvidzayi.25 Internal party procedures should be free, fair and transparent to avoid fissures within party structures.

In as much as factionalism is destructive it can also be perceived as very constructive and a necessary evil in any democratic society. Dissent, friction and discord are the essence of politics in any democratic society and should not be viewed otherwise. Factionalism also has its positive side as it provides a platform for the growth and development of democracy, serves as an avenue for self-expression, brings in the element of diversity in the running of both

party and Governmental affairs, and serves as a platform that encourages debate and comprehensive analysis of problematic issues within the structures of the party. Factionalism also serves as a platform to dissuade issues of a unitary party or government controlled by individuals with the same types of ideologies and mentality.

As the ZANU PF approached the elective congress of 2014, factional politics reached its peak. Explanations can be concluded by three major driving agendas encapsulated in one political sound bite, ‘creed, need and greed’. Creed is defined as any system or codification of belief or of opinion. Need reveals a lack of something deemed necessary.

‘Creed’ maybe perceived as the desire by the party to cleanse itself from unruly elements and behaviour. The Second Secretary and Vice President Joice Mujuru was accused of corruption, trying to assassinate ZANU PF leader Robert Mugabe and fanning factionalism in a bid to gain power. According to Skhanyiso Ndlovu, “The looting; the corruption is so much so alarming to an extent that it leaves you wondering what one would be thinking.” 26 Joice Mujuru was accused of demanding ‘bribes’ (amounting to 10 per cent of initial investment costs) from companies that wished to do business in Zimbabwe. Despite import bans on genetically modified food it is alleged that Mujuru imported poultry from Brazil and genetically modified maize from South Africa without paying import duties and taxes, whilst at the same time putting the health of Zimbabweans at risk. 27 Mujuru also stood accused of using her authority and position to evade the law when her daughter (driving without a licence) was involved in a car accident which claimed the life of an Iranian citizen, Dr. Hamidzadeh. 28 This level of corruption led to Mujuru’s demise as Vice President of the party and the country as she was removed at the 6th annual ZANU PF congress.

Factional politics driven by the need to be in certain positions led to the eventual demise of Mujuru and her allies. The jostling for positions and power became intense during the ZANU PF congress, which was in contrast to the unity showed within the party during the 2013 Harmonised Elections. According to the ‘Think Africa’ press organization, the ZANU PF congress was divided

---


into two opposing camps, one led by Mujuru and the other by Mnangagwa and both sides were jostling for key positions in the party which would see them assume the top postings in the event that high ranking and strategic posts became vacant. Eventually it was the Mnangagwa camp that landed the top positions at provincial and national levels, appointments which were backed by Zimbabwe’s First Lady Dr. Grace Mugabe who herself landed the position of Chairperson of the Women’s League with the unwavering support of the Mnangagwa camp. The vote of no confidence and expulsion from the party became the order of the day as those who previously had voting rights in the provinces were removed from power, and the constitution was changed to give the President exclusive rights to choose individuals who he wanted to work with. It should be noted that career politicians will always be ambitious enough to want to land the top posts by any means possible as witnessed by the events that unfolded before, during and after the ZANU PF elective congress.

Greed and the need to accumulate resources are the prime reasons that fuel factional politics, and such phenomena are supported by the inherent characteristics of human nature in terms of greed. The factional politics that acted out at the ZANU PF congress was a result of greed. According to The Zimbabwean Newspaper, top officials in ZANU PF are alleged to have multiple ownerships of farms which under Zimbabwean law is illegal. Thus in a bid to protect any wealth accumulated from factional politics, the notion of the survival of the fittest was deemed as justifiable by certain individuals and was noticeable before, during and after the ZANU PF Congress.

Notwithstanding, any differential explanation the MDCs can be explained in terms of need. Firstly, it was clear that Biti needed a post higher than he had previously held hence the creation of a rival to ensure he gained ultimate control and leadership of the party. Biti argued that the MDC had become an undemocratic party and there was a need for reform and leadership renewal after the loss to the ZANU PF in the 2013 Harmonised Elections, and thus the formation of the breakaway MDC Renewal Team was deemed necessary. The MDC Renewal Team has since included Welshman Ncube mooting the idea of forming United Movement for Democratic Change party.

Creed is regarded as the desire by the party to clean itself from unruly elements and behaviour. The Tsvangirai led MDC has been widely perceived

---


as undemocratic and corrupt hence the desire to bring to the fore a party that would bring credibility to the stakeholders, local and international partners who include MDC-T structures in the Diaspora, and pro opposition forces beyond Zimbabwe’s borders, as these are generally the main sources of party funding. After the loss in the 2013 Harmonised Elections, the legitimacy of the MDC-T as a genuine opposition party was called into question as was Tsvangirai’s leadership because the integrity of the party was perceived by many as polluted due to Tsvangirai’s apparently ‘colourful’ personal life, a factor which afforded the ZANU PF and other aligned organisations political leverage to be used against him and the party. Tsvangirai was labelled a womaniser by the Public Media and this provided the basis of the ZANU PF campaign. After the party’s dismal performance Biti, the then Secretary General, used the same accusations against Tsvangirai and called for him to step down. This led to a split in the party with Biti and other likeminded individuals breaking away from the MDC-T. According to Jackson, “massive disarray” in the opposition MDC, had contributed to “donor fatigue” and this therefore fuelled the belief by Biti and his team that the formation of a new party would bring back the donors. Tsvangirai however, refused to relinquish power and went on to remove those that had supported Biti and even attempted to eject them from parliament arguing that they were no longer part of the MDC-T. This however was rejected by the Speaker of Parliament, Jacob Mudenda. Tsvangirai went on to push for constitutional changes to the MDC-T which would give the President of the party more powers in terms of the day to day running of the party and thus weaken the Secretary General’s power who had previously been the custodian of the party constitution and finances. The move which was deemed politically correct as he eliminated potential threats can be viewed as undemocratic as democracy generally calls for the decentralisation of power, yet the MDC-T had moved to centralise power.

Creed is also associated with the emergence of a faction calling itself the real ZANU PF which also calls itself by a synonym, “Peoples First”, its belief being that the current ZANU PF has distanced itself from its founding values and is composed of people with no background relating to the defining tenet liberation war and who do not have the mandate of the people to lead, thus this calls itself the original ZANU PF. Its composition is that of renowned liberation

stalwarts such as Joice Mujuru, Didymus Mutasa and Rugare Gumbo. The aim of this group has been to ensure that the ZANU PF respects its constitution, is a democratic party and puts the interests of the people first.\textsuperscript{\ref{footnote1}}

Creed is also associated with the efforts being mooted by the opposition to establish a grand coalition spearheaded by Biti and Ncube. The aim of this grand coalition is the perceived fact that the only way to remove the current ZANU PF from power is through a united opposition rather than a fragmented one. Hence attempts being made to unite the MDC renewal. Mavambo, MDC (Ncube’s faction), ZAPU and MDC-T parties clearly highlight the belief that only a united opposition can unseat ZANU PF from power.\textsuperscript{\ref{footnote2}}

With regard to ‘need’, this is especially illustrated with the admission of the expelled Hurungwe legislator Temba Mliswathat, Joice Mujuru has to openly and clearly come out and fight against the other members of the current ZANU PF. Her continued silence weakens their faction and creates a leadership vacuum from within the faction formed in order to support her bid to get into power. Hence the main need of this faction is for Mujuru to clearly come out into the open and defend her faction, her failure to do so will result in its collapse. With greed comes allegations of corruption against members of the Mujuru faction by members of the current ZANU PF. Such allegations reveal that corruption is rife and endemic. The allegations highlight illegal practice regarding ownership of multiple farms by faction leaders, ownership of several companies and being involved in murky deals for personal enrichment.\textsuperscript{\ref{footnote3}}

Greed is also revealed, with recent reports of the disappearance of funds within the MDC-T coffers which left the party financially embarrassed and begging for support to host its own conference. The party had received substantial support from the political finances act because of its presence in Parliament, however due to lack of proper accounting mechanisms as the party was drawing up congress and leadership workshops it was revealed by its secretary general that the party was extremely underfunded and that it had failed to remunerate its support staff with a large backlog of payments dating back a considerable period of time. Revelations also surfaced that the poor accountability mechanisms within

\begin{footnotes}
\end{footnotes}
the party had given room for widespread corruption especially by those at the higher echelons of the party.36

Conclusion

Political entities should have well-structured succession plans which define the procedures to be taken in event of the loss of a leader through retirement or natural attrition, and these succession plans must cascade upwards or downwards at all levels so that there are no disputes amongst members. The absence of clear cut succession plans has seen founder party leaders (and erstwhile ‘opportunists’) remaining at the helm of power both legally or by any other means. Terms of office should be created and adhered to religiously; Zimbabwe’s political system has been a fertile breeding ground for “brand names” that have become figurative sacred cows to the extent that they become a serious hindrance to leadership changes. The problem of factionalism is not a new phenomenon and will always be present although it can be minimized through strict adherence by party leaders to democratic principles and party constitutions. The factors that have caused factionalism include egoism and egotism, the desire to fight for party resources, personal interests and differences, regionalism, favourable selection procedures for representatives and, of course the ongoing and continuing economic crisis. Pointing to the fact that struggles for power are increasingly imminent, not only at national level but also at local level as well as people struggle for survival. The causes of factionalism in political parties are as old as the presence of political parties themselves, and can be defined by human political behaviour which Hobbes defines as selfish, greedy and aggressive, and is thus natural in human political behaviour. The remedies to this problem include succession planning in political parties, fostering and observing democratic principles, adherence to terms of office and, providing a stable and enabling economic environment.

Made in Turkey: Middle Class, Economic Liberalization and Political Change

Abstract

The emergence of the new middle class in Turkey is perceived as an outcome of economic reforms in the 1980s which inevitably caused changes in the whole structure of Turkish society. There is a vigorous discussion on the so called ‘Islamic middle class’, ‘devout bourgeoisie’, ‘Anatolian Tigers’, and a ‘new Muslim conservative middle class’, but at the same time there is still little systematic research on this subject. The main purpose of this article is to answer the following questions: What kind of economic conditions caused the growth of the new Turkish middle class and what is the relationship between its emergence and a democratization process?

1. Introduction

The middle class is perceived as an essential element of social structures in capitalist countries and one that is a pre-requisite for democracy. In the literature concerning class transformation and socio-economic development, different kinds of approaches towards class dynamics can be followed. On one hand there is a widespread assertion that the world is becoming less poor and more ‘middle-classed’, which – it is believed – in the long term fosters social inclusion and brings about democratic stability. On the other hand, some scholars point out the opposite trend by stressing growing inequalities and increasing ‘pauperization’ of ever broader strata of people. They often emphasize the visibility of the more poorer segments of the population such as the ‘near poor’ or the ‘missing class’ which in the long run implicates further

---

* Researcher at the Institute of Mediterranean and Oriental Cultures, Polish Academy of Sciences, e-mail: awojcik@iksio.pan.pl

1 This work was prepared with the support of financial funds for the statute activity of the Institute of Mediterranean and Oriental Cultures in Polish Academy of Sciences. The funds contribute to the development of young researchers.


instances of polarization and foregoing social conflicts. It can be argued that the both views are contentious. Making judgements from economic performance and human development, in absolute terms, seems misleading too.

The main premise of the ongoing debate on the relevance of middle class and its growth is to recognize the middle class as a main driver of political change that fosters liberal democracy. Even if we acknowledge that today’s world is experiencing a third wave of middle-class growth and the middle class is on the rise primarily in developing countries it does not necessarily mean that in all cases it will take advantage of political opportunities and support the consolidation of democracy (perceived rather as an universal value than as a solely Western concept). Hence, taking the middle class as a priori democratic force under all circumstances seems rather misleading. There are historical examples of non-democratic regimes imposed on societies with large middle-class segments, to mention some Latin American states or the Chinese experience. Moreover, according to a Freedom House survey, despite the huge growth in the middle class, the number of elected democracies worldwide, has remained relatively flat since the mid-1990s. The age-old question of why the middle class supports democracy in some cases and on the other hand has turned against it, continues to pose a difficult challenge for researchers.

A quite startling point of view concerning the interdependence of the middle class and democracy is presented by Joshua Kurlantzick. In his book Democracy in Retreat. The Revolt of the Middle Class and the Worldwide Decline of Representative Government, based on a historical analysis of democratization in developing countries, the author claims that the middle class who fought for democracy in the last few decades is now turning its back against it. Kurlantzick recalls data which indicates that many members of the middle class in these countries have become disillusioned with democracy. As a consequence, they are starting to support more autocratic forms of government, because they believe that it will secure their privileged position. The author points out the

5 Historically, three waves of middle class growth and expansion can be distinguished between. The first wave took place in the 19th century and was produced by the economic changes of the Industrial Revolution. The second wave began in the post-World War II era. Both unfolded mainly in the United States and Europe. The ongoing third great wave of expansion in the middle class shifted from the West to the East, particularly to the Asian states which are at the forefront.


friction within the middle classes and has suggested that a ‘new rising middle class’ has created conflict which seriously impairs democracy.\textsuperscript{8}

The slowdown in global democratization is quite a complex feature that cannot be explained solely by the middle class and its ambivalence towards democracy. The reasons of democratization are varied and in general there is no single factor that would be sufficient to explain regime change.\textsuperscript{9} However, if one concedes to the correlation between wealth and democracy, the middle class does contribute to democratization and along with other indicators provides important clues towards understanding the patterns of democratic development.

There is a long tradition in political science literature to tackle the question: Why does the middle class matter for democracy? The classical argument used by Seymour Martin Lipset in the late 1950s, that “a large middle class plays a mitigating role in moderating conflict since it is able to reward moderate and democratic parties and penalize extremist groups”,\textsuperscript{10} is still in use in much academic writing today. Likewise, Samuel Huntington supported this argument by admitting that the most active devotees of a third wave of democratization came from the urban middle classes.\textsuperscript{11} More recently in a widely influential book by Daron Acemoğlu and James A. Robinson, \textit{Economic Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy}, that relies conceptually on Barrington Moore’s \textit{Social Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy}, its authors also maintain that the elites are more likely to accede to democracy when there is a strong middle class (namely entrepreneurs, academics, professionals).\textsuperscript{12} Thus, examining the middle class within the context of a relationship between the level of socio-

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Concerning the reasons behind the mass shortage of democracies see: Larry Diamond, ‘Facing Up to the Democratic Recession’, \textit{Journal of Democracy}, Vol. 26, No. 1, January 2015.
\item Samuel P. Huntington, \textit{The Third Wave: Democratization in the Late Twentieth Century}, Norman: University Oklahoma Press, 1993, p. 45.
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
economic development and the prospects of democracy, although having been a long tradition, is still a relevant point of investigation.

There are numerous examples of research analysis on the middle class and its position in political and social development processes in Turkey, that have tried to prove that the emergence of a new middle class has been a driving force behind the moderation of political Islam.\textsuperscript{14} The aim of this article is to assess the validity of Lipset’s argument and enrich the debate concerning Turkish case studies by answering the following questions: How can middle class issues be studied? What kind of economic conditions caused the growth of the new Turkish middle class and what is the relationship between its emergence and the democratization process? Does the new middle class explain the rise of right-wing populist Islamic parties and the ascent of Muslim conservatives to power?

The first part of this paper will be devoted to the conceptual issue and definition of the middle class. Then, the economic history of Turkey (divided into two periods: the liberalization period 1983–2001 and the post-liberalization period) will be presented. The third part will concentrate on the social and political implications of economic development with reference to the new, Turkish middle class and its capacity to ameliorate political Islam and its effects on the democratization process.

2. Middle class question

The middle class as other social class concepts is a rather multifaceted term with a number of meanings. Therefore, even considering the huge weight and scope of research, there is no general consensus on how to define the middle class. Moreover, the character of the middle class is determined by a particular and evolving nature of social structure of a given society. Thus, it can be subjective from country to country, and region to region. But in a general sense it is a category that according to certain chosen criteria – such as education,

occupation, income (ownership) and authority – defines a large portion of the population that is situated in the middle of the ‘social ladder’. Among these criteria, income is prevalent and represents the most common factor used in most assessments of the middle class. A widely accepted definition of the middle class, perceived in economic terms, is the share of the population living on at least $10 per capita per day in Purchasing Power Parity (PPP) terms.\(^\text{15}\) Besides this economic determinant, some scholars stress the importance of cultural and social constructions of the middle classes according to which people who belong this middle class also share similar values, beliefs and ideologies.

However, the middle class is not a monolithic and compact social layer. Compared to the poor and the rich, that together constitute a tree class model, the middle class contains a greater range of interests and covers a wide range of occupations and social groups. Moreover, the social differentiation of the middle class and its distinction between the new and the old is also a common denominator for the general development processes of the middle class. In addition, among the old and new middle classes, it is possible to make further distinctions.

Therefore, middle class cohesion and the degree of its social homogeneity is another vibrant problem. An increasing social and ideological diversification/fragmentation within the middle classes additionally complicates and obfuscates the outlook, and provokes the question concerning its ability to act and participate in politics as a corporate (even if highly individualized) entity. Thus, the question about middle class identity and common political attitudes around which its members could unite is often contested.\(^\text{16}\) Kim Weeden and David Grusky insightfully reviewed postmodernist criticism which claimed the failures of class analysis by arguing that attitudes and behaviors arise from a “complex mosaic of taste subcultures” and therefore are not related to class membership.\(^\text{17}\)

\(^\text{15}\) Nancy Birdsall defined the middle class in developing countries according to its spending/consumption capacity, as being composed of those people with an income of between $10 a day and at or below the 95th percentile of the income distribution, Nancy Birdsall, ‘The (Indispensable) Middle Class…’, p. 161; See also an interesting analysis about the main difficulties associated with the measurement of the middle class written by Luis F. López-Calva and Eduardo Ortiz-Juarez, ‘A Vulnerability Approach to the Definition of the Middle Class’, *Journal of Economic Inequality*, Vol. 12, No. 1, 2014.


In contemporary societies each individual has multiple group identities. Hence, one may think of themselves primarily as a member of the Turkish middle class, and as a Muslim, or as Kurds who belong to this particularly ethnic community. This ‘collective identity’ or collective identities remain ‘neutral’ unless they are politicized.\(^{18}\) How then do we assess which ‘identity’ is the leading one and when it is politicized? The question also arises whether members of the middle classes are much more engaged in political activism than members of other social groups?

However, it is beyond the scope of this paper to answer all the questions raised. Furthermore it seems impossible to grasp at once the complexity of the middle class along with many elements that are equally important to its comprehensive understanding. Regardless of all ‘middle class dilemmas’, it is necessary to take a closer look at the model of economic development and its stages that bring fundamental changes in the social class structure and have contributed to the middle class evolution.

3. Turkey’s economic transition since 1980 and afterwards

Turkey’s sociopolitical development and economic performance has attracted scholars’ attention as arguably one of the most comprehensive and far-reaching ‘modernization’ projects, not only among the Muslim world but also in developing countries.\(^{19}\) Since its establishment in 1923 the Turkish Republic was guided by different industrialization strategies.\(^{20}\) For decades the Turkish political economy has been characterized by inward-oriented, state-led industrialization. Its major turn towards an outward-oriented economy open to the global markets started in the early 1980s, when Turkey tried to overcome the


\(^{19}\) Turkey’s economic success has been hailed as a “source of inspiration for a number of developing countries”, Turkey’s Transitions. Integration, Inclusion, Institutions, Washington DC: World Bank, 2014, p. 3.

\(^{20}\) The following periods in the economic history of Turkey can be distinguished between. Starting from the short episode of relative economic liberalism (1923–1929), then moved into etatism, known as the inward-oriented state led industrialization period (1930–1945). After 1945 the second phase of economic liberalism took place that lasted until the late 1950s, when the economic crisis erupted. Subsequently between 1950–1980 import-substitution industrialization strategies were implemented. Then, from the 1980s onwards a new type of economy policy based on neoliberal principles was introduced.
severe crisis of 1977–1979 which brought the country to the brink of economic collapse and civil war.\textsuperscript{21}

The incompetent handling of foreign debts, compounded by the effects of increasing global oil prices, led to triple-digit inflation. Furthermore, there was a sharp rise in unemployment and a breakdown in industrial production. All these constraints forced the Turkish government into undertaking necessary structural changes. Since then a far-reaching neo-liberal restructuring policy towards the Turkish economy has been implemented simultaneously with the process of a resumption of democracy.

3.1. The liberalization period

The official start of this shift was the announcement of a liberalization and stabilization package by the government on January 24, 1980. The main aim of the austerity program, known as the “24 January Decisions”, was to redefine the economic role of the state and open up the Turkish economy to external competition through trade liberalization, financial market deregulation, a removing of restrictions on foreign exchange transactions and a reduction in public sector spending. The program did not engender mass appeal in that there was strong opposition in Turkish society and within the government. Strikes staged by labor movements, and political violence were quite common at that time. The ideological differences with regards to a state-directed economy as opposed to one that was market-oriented, highlighted a clearly visible rift between the left and the right. Moreover, left wing opposition as well as the Islamist National Salvation Party (Millî Selâmet Partisi, MSP) led by Necmettin Erbakan challenged the January 24 Decisions and obstructed its implementation.\textsuperscript{22} The Süleyman Demirel who served as a head of the government was unable to gain the political support essential to a successful enactment of the package.

With the aim of quelling political unrest the Turkish military forces took control of the government on 12 September 1980. Although the army did not traditionally favor open trade and market-oriented economic policies, it endorsed the “24 January Decisions”. Turgut Özal (prime minister 1983–1989; president 1989–1993) was then appointed as deputy prime minister, responsible for the economic affairs of the interim government. He was a leading figure responsible for overseeing the implementation of the “24 January Decisions” under the guidance of international financial institutions such as the International

\textsuperscript{21} The late 1970s were marked by a radicalized social and political climate characterized by violence and escalating tension between extreme left wing, radical Islamist, and neo-fascist movements.

Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Bank (WB). Özal’s experience from the World Bank, whom he worked for in the early 1970s, influenced his views on economic policy but also provided him with the ability to negotiate and merge national economic interests with the IMF and the World Bank interests. Both the IMF and the WB were directly involved in the Turkish government’s adjustment program by adequate financing agreements. Turkey was one of the first major test cases for the WB’s new program of structural adjustment lending, in cooperation with the IMF’s stabilization program.23

With the 1983 election, the military regime ended and democracy was restored. The newly formed Motherland Party (Anavatan Partisi, ANAP) won on a platform of economic success and concentrated on inflation as the principal target for further policy reform. Its leader Turgut Özal became the democratically elected prime minister. During his premiership (1983–1989), a new wave of liberalization was launched. The economy grew and international trade increased. The share of output for exports rose from five percent in 1979 to 23 percent in 1989, and real output roughly doubled.24 However, national debt and inflation also soared.

The Özal government demonstrated a combination of Islamic values and modern Republican conservatism to win the election. Therefore, the ANAP was able to gain and maintain the confidence of wide segments of the electorate encompassing the center right, liberals, Islamists and secularists. Moreover, according to Ziya Öniş and Steven Webb, the long period of ANAP majority rule (1983–1991) helped to consolidate reforms to such a degree that all the principal parties agreed on a broadly similar economic program. In this sense, the ideological rift between the left and the right – state-directed versus market-oriented – substantially diminished.25

After a quite successful 1980s, the Turkish economy experienced an unstable era during the 1990s and beyond. The economic crisis in 1994 and the particularly acute crisis of 2000–2001, when the financial system almost collapsed and the currency was devalued, defined this “lost decade”. Perhaps the only important achievement from an economic and also a political standpoint of that time, was a customs union agreement with the EU which came into force on 31 December 1995. Although the government, under the auspices of subsequent coalitions,

---

continued to work towards a neoliberal economy and encouraged the further privatization of state enterprises, no significant progress was made from this perspective.

### 3.2 The post-liberalization era

As a result of the financial crisis in 2001, there was an urgent need to restructure the Turkish banking sector and to implement new business regulations. Kemal Derviş, an economist who worked for the WB, was appointed as the economy minister in 2001–2002. He developed and implemented a three year economic recovery program based on fiscal discipline and large budget surpluses, which won for Turkey a huge rescue package from the IMF and the WB. Moreover, during that time the government established structural reforms in the agriculture and energy sectors. Since 2002 the Turkish economy has shown signs of stabilization and growth. The real GDP which had declined by 9.5 per cent in 2001, increased by about 35 per cent during next four years. Also annual inflation was reduced to less than 8 per cent, a level not seen since 1960.26

Along with the victory of the Justice and Development Party (Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi, AKP) in the 2002 election, a new pace of free market policies known as the post-liberalization period began to take effect. The AKP, a market-oriented party with ideological roots in the Turkish Islamist movement,27 was able to form the first single-party government since 1991. The parliamentary election in June 2015 marked a political change, as the AKP was deprived of its parliamentary majority and lost its aura of invincibility. A new pro-Kurdish political force, the People’s Democratic Party (Halkların Demokratik Partisi, HDP), surpassed the 10 per cent threshold required for parliamentary representation. A coalition government could not be formed, thus a further election was held on November 1, 2015. However in this revised election the AKP regained the majority required for single-party rule and captured 49.3 percent of the popular vote.28 What was it then that enhanced the legitimacy of the AKP rule?

---


27 The political origins of the AKP derived from the National Outlook Movement (millî görüş) tradition represented by various Islamist parties who were dissolved for their anti-secular activities. The AKP was founded in 2001 by the politicians from the Welfare Party (Refah Partisi, RP) and the Virtue Party (Fazilet Partisi, FP). These parties represented the so called modernists (yenilikçiler) outlook that differentiates their members from the traditionalists (gelenekçiler) as established by the Felicity Party (Saadet Partisi, SP). On the AKP history and ideology see: William Hale and Ergün Özbudun, *Islamism, Democracy and Liberalism: The Case of AKP*, London: Routledge, 2010.

During 13 years of AKP’s majority government Turkey had undergone profound changes and its economy grew rapidly. In terms of GDP, the Turkish economy ranks sixteenth in the world and sixth in Europe. Since the beginning of the AKP’s first term in office it had ushered in pro-market and pro-European economic policies. As a result Turkey has opened up further to the global economy and expanded its presence in new markets. The unprecedented achievements in trade, finance, enterprises and infrastructure upgraded Turkey’s economy and highlighted its vast potential.

Between 2002–2007, the real GDP growth rate was between 4.7 per cent and 9.4 per cent per year, thus establishing an average of around 7 per cent. This five-year period is referred to as the “golden age”. According to Kemal Derviş, the primary results of economic growth were the outcome of the structural reforms that the country had started after becoming a candidate state for EU membership in 1999, and also thanks to Ali Babacan’s (minister of economic affairs 2002–2007) efforts in maintaining the independence of institutions adopting monetary policy.

At the end of 2007 the annual growth rate of real GDP fell slightly, and due to the global financial crisis in 2008 it retracted to nearly zero. In the following years it increased significantly to 4.8 per cent in 2009, 9.2 per cent in 2010 and 8.8 per cent in 2011, statistics which highlighted Turkey as one of the world’s fastest-growing economies. However the real GDP rate slowed sharply to 2.9 per cent in 2014. Demir Şeker and Stephen Jenkins who examined poverty trends in Turkey between 2003–2013 argue that economic growth has been the principal driver behind the declines in the absolute poverty rate in Turkey. Therefore analogically speaking, the two periods are distinguishable. Between 2003–2008 absolute poverty declined rapidly, and from 2008 onwards the decline was slower. In the 2000s income inequality also declined. The Gini coefficient (a standard measure of income inequality) that during the Özal

---


32 Şeker and Jenkins, ‘Poverty Trends…’, p. 422.
decade had fallen to an interval of 0.4–0.5, dropped further in the AKP decade below the 0.4 level.\textsuperscript{33}

In the period between 2007–2015 a visible turnaround in Turkey’s political and economic reform processes can be noticed. It can be argued that once the AKP government, that had earlier supported an open economic market, became sufficiently powerful it completely changed its previous policy. Turkey experienced devolution by way of corruption scandals, nepotism and growing authoritarian rule. As noted by Daron Acemoğlu and Murat Üçer, the collapse of EU-accession talks played an arguably exaggerated role in this reversal, by both removing a powerful anchor tying the AKP to the reform processes and undermining the support that had built up for institutional change within a fairly broad segment of the Turkish population.\textsuperscript{34} The recent domestic political turmoil\textsuperscript{35} and the uncertain situation in the neighboring states, particularly the war in Syria, hinders economic progress and makes Turkey’s economy vulnerable to challenge. However, the AKP economic management is usually given as one of the leading reasons for its recurring success.

4. Social and political implications of Turkey’s economic transition

What are the social implications of Turkey’s economic transition? How has the adaptation of market-economy principles affected its citizens? At the end of the 1980s, in the field of social structure research, scholars began to answer questions as to whether systemic transformation in the economy and the political system is accompanied by the emergence of ‘new’ class-tiered segments. Answers were needed, generally speaking, as to what exactly was the social base of these layers and what kind of value systems and political orientations

\textsuperscript{33} Şahan Savaş Karataşlı, ‘The Origins of Turkey’s “Heterodox” Transition to Neoliberalism: The Özal Decade and Beyond’, \textit{Journal of World-Systems Research}, Vol. 21, No. 2, 2015, p. 407. According to OECD data in the mid-1980s and late 2000s, the income inequalities in OECD countries have been increasing. However within Turkey and Greece there are exceptions as opposing trends can be observed as inequalities have decreased; see: \textit{An Overview of Growing Income Inequalities: Main Findings}, Washington DC: OECD, 2011, p. 24.


\textsuperscript{35} After the election in June 2015, the Kurdistan Workers’ Party (PKK) attacks turned many cities in the southeast into fireplaces. Moreover the double suicide bombing carried out by jihadist Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL) that killed 102 people in Ankara in October 2015, caused a security issue that became the leading slogan of the latest election campaign which successfully diverted attention away from economic problems.
were produced? This transformation redefines the different social groups and their position in society as well. There is a general belief, that the rise of the middle class in Turkey – and particularly the so called ‘new middle class’ – is an outcome of economic liberalization. Those “newly arrived members” of the middle class – who have benefited from economic development and have started to demand their economic fair share – constituted its new faction. Hence, it can be acknowledged that economic growth accelerated the social differentiation of the Turkish middle class.

In Turkey, as elsewhere in the world, there were winners and inevitable losers from market-oriented policies. The main beneficiary of import substitution-industrialization (ISI) policies of the 1960s and 1970s is considered to be the Istanbul based industrial bourgeoisie, whereas the neoliberal restructuring reforms were beneficial and favorable for many different groups. The “owners of regionally located smaller enterprises,” – that is SMEs – which dramatically grew throughout Turkey in the 1980s and the 1990s, made the best of this liberalization period. The other sectors more affected were agriculture and labor.

During Turgut Özal’s term of office the middle class gained special attention. As Metin Heper argued, Özal attempted to create a stronger ‘middle class society’ and upgrade the economic and social status of the urban working and middle classes, which he referred to as Orta Direk (middle pillar). He often emphasized that “the silent Muslim majority” would benefit from the political, economic, and social transformations he had started. Thanks to the endeavors of privatization, Özal was more or less able to attract and reinvigorate the middle income populations and small investors. Since that time the religiously conservative new middle class became an important social force. Moreover, some of the small and medium size enterprises accumulated capital to such a degree that it allowed them to develop and fully engage in international trade, a factor which saw them rise above the status of SME’s. These enterprises, which became known as ‘Anatolian Tigers’, started to challenge the older and


powerful bourgeoisie. According to a World Bank report, the Turkish middle class (defined as the population living on at least $10 per capita per day in Purchasing Power Parity terms) since 1993 has more than doubled and accounts for more than 40 percent of the population.

Some scholars highlighted the religious orientation of this newly affluent middle class by emphasizing its Islamic and religious, conservative characteristics as distinguishable from the old/traditional factions who had been exposed to a rather secular worldview. However it can be argued that the ideological cleavages between the new members of the middle class as opposed to the older ones, became less perceptible due to common class interests and the more consensual policies of the AKP and its initial ability to mediate between various segments of society. The political success of the AKP had already proved that this party had managed to attract different voters ranging from Islamists to rural nationalists and moderate urbanites.

How was it possible for the mainstream Islamist groups to be ‘absorbed’ into the global capitalist system? Cihan Tuğal skillfully analyzed the different social and political consequences of neoliberalism in Egypt and Turkey. He argued that in both countries free market policies were imposed from above but resisted from below. However in the Turkish case, neoliberalism became embraced in the name of Islam and democracy. Consequently, it de-radicalized Islamist groups by ‘absorbing’ them into the global capitalist system. Thus, Turkish Islamist politicians reinvented themselves to operate according to economic principles. Tuğal stated that, “the new leadership of the AKP set the scene for the absorption of Islamism into secular neoliberalism, more or less successfully at all levels of the hegemonic formation”.

---

39 In May 1990 they established a new business organization called the Independent Businessmen and Industrialist Association (Müstakil Sanayici ve İşadamları Derenği, MÜSİAD) that advocated full liberalization and privatization reforms. This association became the counter-force for the rivalry group Association of Turkish Industrialists and Businessmen (Türk İşadamları ve Sanayiciler Derenği, TÜSİAD) which was supported by the state and associated with ‘crony capitalism’. For more on the case of both associations see: Hakan Yavuz, *Islamic Political Identity in Turkey*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003, p. 92–96.

40 *Turkey’s Transitions: Integration…*, p. 6. According to a recent survey ‘Orta Sınıfı Anlamak’ [Understanding the Middle Class] conducted by the Ipsos KMG Social Research Institute, a total of 59 per cent of the Turkish population belongs to the middle class (which is determined also by income criteria, having polled 16,000 people over the age of 14).


5. Conclusions

Some Turkish scholars have contended that Turkish ‘middle class society’ is rather a ‘utopia’ that was invented in order to legitimize the global order of exploitation. Thus, they recognized the intermediate class as an ideological construct that had a political mission. Perhaps ‘making everyone middle class’ oversimplifies Turkish social reality rather than facilitates its proper understanding. However, one cannot totally debunk and neglect the middle class’ existence.

Moreover the rise and evolution of the Turkish middle class continues to display its own dynamic that contributes to Turkey’s social and political development. This is encapsulated by a particular kind of political Islam that has successfully merged with neoliberal policy, having been fuelled by a highly entrepreneurial middle class that has strongly supported and become symbolically representative of the AKP government.

Due to difficulties in proving that the middle class, which is not monolithic, develops coherent political attitudes, it is easier sometimes to state that it is rather diverse in terms of its own culture and politics. However in the Turkish context it should also be indicated that although some emphasis can be placed on the ideological differences between both the ‘newly affluent religiously conservative’ and ‘traditional secular-oriented’ middle classes, it can nevertheless be said that both groups share common class interests, which brought the AKP to power and contributed to its success over a decade.

A conclusion can be drawn that despite the confrontational split within middle class strata and the intra-class conflict that was quite visible in the initial phase of economic liberalization, a much more favourable climate for dialogue and interest convergences was built during the first five years of the AKP rule. However, later on a reversal of this trend can be noticed.

Thus, in conclusion the following questions should be addressed: Why does the Turkish middle class matter in terms of democracy? And does it strengthen and determine how far Turkish democracy can go? Undoubtedly, it can be stated that a strong middle class has the potential to set boundaries and regulations so that Turkish democracy cannot recede. Summarizing, we should refer to Soner Çağaptay, who in his recent publication, argued that “Turkey has crossed a threshold-it is too middle class and too diverse to fall under a one-size-fits-all

---

democracy, and a burgeoning civil society is becoming a grassroots check on the AKP’s prerogatives”.

---

Editorial Principles

Articles submitted to the journal should not be submitted elsewhere. Authors are responsible for obtaining permission to publish any material under copyright (see the ‘Ghostwriting’ and ‘Statement for authors’ files on www.iksio.pan.pl/hemispheres).

Articles must be in English, French or in German. The article should begin with an abstract of up to 100 words, followed by five keywords which should describe the article’s main arguments and conclusions. Manuscript length should not exceed 40,000 characters (including the main text, footnotes, and spaces), and should be typed on A4 paper, in 12-point Times New Roman font, with ample margins on all sides. Dates should be given thus: 1 July 1991.

The entire manuscript must be 1½-spaced and numbered consecutively. The title, the author’s name and her/his institutional affiliation should be at the top of the first page (do not use headnotes). All titles in non-Roman alphabets must be transliterated. An English translation of other language titles should be provided in square brackets after the title.

Footnotes at the bottom of the text page are obligatory.

Quotations must be numbered consecutively throughout the text, typed single-spaced in paragraph style, and grouped together as a unit following the text. The style of note citation should conform with the following examples.


When notes to the same work follow after interruption, use the author’s last name and a shortened title of the book or article. **Do not use op.cit.**

9. Ibid., p. 186.

More substantial editing will be returned to the author for approval before publication. No rewriting will be allowed at the proof stage. Authors will be asked to return the material to the editorial office within 4 days of receipt, or approval will be assumed.

Articles are qualified on the basis of a double-blind review process by external referees. (see the ‘Peer Review Process’ file at www.iksio.pan.pl/hemispheres).

The journal is edited primarily in a print version. Articles from current and recent issues are also available online at www.iksio.pan.pl/hemispheres.

The author of a printed article will receive 20 free off-prints of the article.

Manuscripts and all editorial correspondence should be addressed to Professor Jerzy Zdanowski, Institute of Mediterranean and Oriental Cultures, Polish Academy of Sciences, 72 Nowy Świat Str., 00–330 Warsaw, Poland, tel./fax (+48) 228266356, e-mail: hemispheres@iksio.pan.pl.